

## REVIEWS

'Botan' (Subha Luesiri) *Jotmai Jak Mueng Thai (Letters from Thailand)* (Prae Pitaya, Bangkok), 1970, 2 volumes pp. 515 and pp. 526, 39 baht each.

On the dust jacket of the much discussed *Jotmai Jak Mueng Thai (Letters from Thailand)*, which won the SEATO literary award last year, there is a statement from the author which makes it clear that hers is a novel with a purpose, and it appears clear to the reader after reading less than a quarter of the two volumes what the author's purpose is. With unusual candidness and impressive thoroughness the author offers a picture of Thai society and the Thais as seen by Chinese immigrants, represented here by a young thinking immigrant of considerable education. In order to keep in touch with his dearly loved mother whom he left behind in China to come and seek livelihood in Thailand, and also to clear his mind of oppressing thoughts on his new life circumstances, Tan Suang U, the central character of the book, writes to her altogether a hundred letters all of considerable length, over a period of twenty years from B.E. 2488 (1945).

These letters, at least the first few dozen, are refreshing to read for several reasons. First of all it is a change to read in a novel (and we have no choice but to consider this work a novel since the author herself regards it as one in her preface) so many home truths about ourselves and our society all stated with such unusual directness and intrepidity. Botan, the author, through the mouth of Tan Suang U (or rather through his newly acquired fountain pen which he considers new-fangled and does not quite approve of) makes a thorough inventory of the Thais' failings and the diseases of Thai society. The Thais are lazy, rude to shopkeepers, rude to foreigners unless they are *farang*, jealous of the Chinese, superstitious, overindulgent to their offspring, given to gambling, wife-beating, ostentatious display of wealth etc. etc. Corrupt officials, the Thai educational system, beauty contests, nightclubs, massage parlours, imported motor cars, women's fashions, professional beggars and so forth, all feature in the long list of complaints. Obviously the author's intention is constructive, but how effective the execution of her theme is is a question we must examine in relation to the novel as a whole.

Secondly, the letters are interesting and valuable as documents. They include a number of the major news items of the period, such as the public scandal over the late Prime Minister's private life, the fate of the notorious sex maniac See-ooy, the public execution of the two men found guilty of arson. What is even more interesting, and indeed charming, is the description of Chinese customs and references to Chinese ideals and tradition, all of which are stamped with marks of authenticity. Who else among our contemporary lady novelists can tell us, in the course of telling her story, for instance, that the ideal family size for the Chinese is five boys and two girls, or that Chinese boys and girls come out, or 'enter the flower-garden' as they call it, at the age of fifteen?

To come back to the purpose of the novel, in the author's statement on the dust cover referred to above, Botan talks about a 'sharp thorn' which she as an author proposes to extract before it has a chance to fester. It is quite clear that she hopes her criticisms, which she suspects will hurt, will have a salutary effect. On first encounter they do indeed startle one, and even make one feel uncomfortable, largely because of their directness. But after the impact of the first few attacks one realises that there is really nothing new or startling in the criticisms. They all ring true, but one accepts them as being just because they are results of collective consciousness, and not because they are profound truths observed by a keen perceptive eye of better than average vision. Furthermore, the manner, the style, in which they are expressed is so undistinctive and the personality of the man who expresses them so colourless, that these criticisms are not likely to cut very deep. In fact the total lack of irony is somewhat disappointing, since the first letter, portraying Tan as a wide-eyed innocent seeing a fountain-pen for the first time in his life and describing it in detail, and later expressing genuine perplexity at his foster father saying that in Thailand bits of paper are valued more than real scholarship, rather leads one, with its Swiftian touch, to hope (wrongly perhaps) for some satirical treatment by means of an ingenu narrator.

To balance the criticisms Botan, in the latter part of the book, weaves into the narrative some good points about the Thais, particularly some hopeful signs for the future, and the social commentary ends with an emphasis on the value of tolerance, understanding and calm acceptance.

Choosing to present her social commentary in the novel form Botan runs against many difficulties. With the single person epistolary narrative form, and with the central character providing a linear narration of events, unity is no problem. The plot is straightforward, but it is neither strong nor exciting, and obviously serves merely to hold together other elements of the novel. The theme of a proud man with strong convictions crushed, ground, purified and invigorated by lessons of life and emerging a sadder and wiser man is indeed one which appeals to the unchanging human heart. Unfortunately it is a very difficult one to bring off, especially in a work in which social commentary and documentation play such a prominent part, leaving little room for 'inner life' as it were. Botan, moreover, is faced with the difficulties inherent in the form she chose—the first person narration in the form of one-way correspondence. As the central character, Tan Suang U certainly has plenty of presence, but the way in which and the extent to which Botan uses him for her sociological purposes leaves him one of the least attractive characters in fiction. The greater part of her social criticism is made through Tan's mouth, cold, in general statements, unwoven into the web of the story. Even the episodes of actual experience of social significance, such as the episode of a Thai shopper being rude to Tan in letter No. 21, and that of his little son being insulted by his Thai employees, seem to be isolated events and one feels that they are simply there to illustrate social points which Tan has all readymade. Rarely is the reader invited to watch and judge for himself what the significance of each event or social phenomenon is. In other words, the thoughts and observations conveyed by Tan fail to make a strong impact and his character fails to touch us as a human being because he is presented to us too much by means of direct information on himself by himself and too little by allowing us to watch him in different revealing situations. He tells his mother, for example, that his wife's death and that of his foster father affect him deeply with feelings of sorrow and remorse. We believe him of course, intellectually, but we are not made to share his grief. When his parental ambition begins its long course of self-defeat, his suffering does not really touch us. This is also because the family disasters Botan chooses are so stereotyped—the dearly loved only son running off with a prostitute and a daughter

becoming pregnant before marriage—that they savour too much of melodrama, and also because we do not see the situations from any other angle but Tan's. Admittedly here we should allow for the limitations of the first person narrative form, but it would not be right to allow too much, because after all the author chose the form and it has been used often enough in the history of fiction and there is evidence that these limitations could be overcome, and indeed charged with utmost significance.

Of the supporting characters Meng Choo, the youngest daughter, and Vinyu should be considered the first in importance, since they represent the forces which bring about changes in Tan's attitudes. Meng Choo, the Cordelia of the self-discovery-through-suffering theme, is one of the most fully portrayed characters in the whole book, yet she remains curiously cold and wooden. Determined to build her up as a no-nonsense kind of girl, Botan rarely allows the girl to betray her feelings—if any such are attributed to her. As for her young man Vinyu, representative of the 'new generation', with all his platitudes and machine-made concepts, he is quickly conjured up only towards the close of the book and appears too little to have a chance to become a living character, and so he must remain a personified set of attributes. Altogether this pair of 'new Thais', the qualities and attitudes they represent, and their effect on Tan are all too neat to carry much conviction. The unintentional irony of it all is that their self-assuredness and dogmatic pronouncements remind one a little of the former Tan.

With the exception of Ung Buay, the sister-in-law, none of the minor characters makes a very deep impression. Gim, the friend from China, at the beginning of the book shows promise of a comic character—greedy, rather stupid, fond of women and apt to talk in his sleep—but later on he just fades out. Mui Eng, the fairy-tale princess of unusual character with a will of her own, simply becomes a shadowy figure of a wife, fat and dull. Vengkim, the son, and an agent of his father's disappointed life, is memorable for his outburst, when he rounds upon his reproving father and tells him that his waywardness has been a result of the psychological conflicts he has suffered in trying to meet the demands of old Chinese standards at home and modern Thai standards at school

and elsewhere. Clearly the author has a real point here. Unfortunately instead of making us see the problem in a situation gradually built up, she puts it, all of a sudden, in one speech from the mouth of the defendant himself, and the result sounds a little like something out of a social worker's treatise.

The greatest success in characterization Botan achieves in the whole work is undoubtedly in her portraying of Ung Buay. Here the author's touch is noticeably lighter than with the rest of the characters—she suggests and describes symptoms rather than gives diagnosis. Tan admits that he does not understand her and his attitude towards her is ambivalent anyway, and so we are spared his definite views. Her character and its development are consistent and plausible throughout—a gay engaging child, growing up into a fearless woman of unusually strong character who, we are led to suspect, entertains a secret love for her brother-in-law who must have appeared to her childhood fairy-tale orientated vision as a charming prince from a faraway land. The unacknowledged love-hate relationship between her and Tan Suang U, ending finally with Tan's plan to marry her at the end of the book, is very well done, and Botan here deserves much praise for the sureness of her delicate touch.

*Jotmai Jak Mueng Thai* is a book of definite time and place—time: twenty years from B.E. 2488 to 2508 (1945-1965), and place: Bangkok. Nevertheless, it is curiously lacking in atmosphere. And in spite of the intermittent references to such things as the influx of luxury items, modern buildings and woman's fashion, there is very little sense of progression in time.

Finally, a few words about Botan's prose. It is consistently lucid, straightforward, assured and very readable. For the purpose of description and exposition of ideas it does admirably. For the dialogue it is slightly stilted. Admittedly the unnaturalness can be explained away by the accepted pretence that these letters have been translated from a Chinese original. However, this excuse cannot be stretched to cover the unhappy use of the rather special upper class third person pronoun "เขา" by Vengkim referring to the daughter of a foodstall owner about whom he is being rather rude (letter No. 65).

In spite of all its imperfections *Jotmai Jak Mueng Thai* commands a special place in the development of Thai fiction, for it represents a brave attempt to use the novel form to deal seriously with a specific theme of social relevance. Unlike many of her contemporaries, Botan is not content to entertain with 'silverfork novels' or to satisfy the reading public's hunger for sensational fare with 'minor-wife' tales, and for this reason she deserves to be read with thoughtful attention and judged by the standards worthy of the novel as a serious art form. We look forward to seeing more works of fiction from her, and with her social concern and allegiance to truth we hope that in future she will "suffer reality only to suggest" and not so much "to dictate".

*Napa Bhonghibhat*

Klaus Rosenberg *Die traditionellen Theaterformen Thailands von den Anfängen bis in die Regierungszeit Rama's VI* (=Mitteilungen der Gesellschaft für Natur-und Völkerkunde Ostasiens, Band LIV), Hamburg 1970, pp. 425. DM. 38.—

It might not be too early to speak of the "Hamburg-School" of Thai Studies. If Hamburg University could turn out publications on Thailand of the same quality as those which have been appearing in recent years (cf. JSS, July 1970, pp. 157-162), it would not be surprising that Hamburg might one day take the lead in literary research on Thailand. Dr. Klaus Rosenberg's book "Thailand's Traditional Theatrical Forms from the Beginnings to the Reign of Rama VI" is unmistakably a product of the Hamburg School. Studies of literary genres seem to have been one of the major preoccupations of the school, and we have already had a very succinct account of the "kāp hē rüö" by Prof. Klaus Wenk. Dr. Rosenberg's study also deals with a traditional art-form, but it is more ambitious in its scope. In this latest work, one finds the same philological thoroughness, solid documentation and great erudition characteristic of the Hamburg School. As has been the case with Prof. Wenk's book, Dr. Rosenberg's work also provides a corrective to the notorious "Indomania" of certain Thai scholars, although the message, in this case, is rather implicit than explicit. (cf pp. 362-363)

The author, being a German, cannot possibly treat drama as a purely literary genre, for who could remain impervious to Richard Wagner's theory of the *Gesamtkunstwerk*? (cf. p. 360) This conception of the drama as a pluralistic art-form naturally involves the author in certain technical difficulties, as we shall see later. Dr. Rosenberg does not only trace the historical development of the various types of traditional drama in Thailand from the Ayutthaya-Period to the reign of Rama VI, but he also gives particular attention to non-literary aspects of Thai drama such as music, costume, choreography, stage-conventions and even financial matters related to the theatre. The book abounds in detailed information about theatrical life in Old Siam, and if a curious reader would like to know, for example, how much a common player was paid during the reign of Rama III, he would certainly not be disappointed. We are well-informed as to how *khōn* masks are made, or what types of leather are used for *nang* figures. The book is probably the most comprehensive and best documented account of classical Thai drama ever written in any Western language. In its own way, it is a remarkable feat of scholarship, and a student of English literature would probably be awakened by reminiscences of such monumental work as E.K. Chambers' "Elizabethan Stage" when faced with Rosenberg's "opus magnum".

But that is as far as the analogy would go. In the case of Dr. Rosenberg's book, one could hardly speak of original research. The author never denies how much he owes to elder scholars. Any Thai reader would be gratified to note that the major part of Rosenberg's sources are the works of Thai scholars. Many Western researchers have been saying that literary scholarship in Thailand is still in its infancy, and to a certain extent they may not be totally mistaken. But for once, Thai scholars have proved that they know their own drama well enough. This is not meant to be a general evaluation of Thai scholarship. Dr. Rosenberg himself is fully aware of the fact that many of the findings of his Thai colleagues are not free from conjectures. But without the works of Prince Damrong, Prince Dhani, Mr. Dhanit Yupho, Mr. Montri Tramot, to name only a few, the book under review could not have been written at all. It is all the more amazing that Dr. Rosenberg could have written the present study without at the time having made a single "field-trip"

to Thailand. The Library of the Thai Department in Hamburg must be very fine indeed!

The term "traditional" as used by Dr. Rosenberg needs some clarification. He interprets traditional Thai theatre as that "which originated in the 'Old Thailand', during those times when cultural and political influence from Europe was not yet, or was not at all perceptible." (p. 1) Whether one agrees with Dr. Rosenberg or not, one has to accept his definition as a term of reference. Many Thai readers will certainly regret that some of their favourite types of drama have had to be left out of this study. Both the *lăkhon rŋng* and *lăkhon dūkdamban* cannot be reckoned as "traditional" drama. A masterpiece like King Chulalongkorn's *Ngö Pā* is not "traditional" either, and Dr. Rosenberg only deals with it very briefly. (p. 176) *Nang tälung* unfortunately has to be left out as well, because it was introduced into Thailand from Java only in the middle of the 19th Century and "for this reason does not belong to the traditional Thai theatre". (p. 311) Another observation has to be made with regard to Dr. Rosenberg's treatment of the traditional theatre. At times he tends to look at these traditional types of drama as constituting some kind of unity and continuity within themselves. The section on the "structure" of *lăkhon*, *khon* and *răbam* suffers from a lack of historical perspective. A "structural" approach to literary study is in most cases non-historical, and it must be handled with utmost caution. As one reads this section, one cannot help feeling that the various characteristics of traditional Thai theatre are presented in such a way that they remain static. In many instances, we are almost led to think that many of the theatrical conventions remained unchanged from the Ayuthaya Period to the Bangkok Period, simply because the author has not brought out their development in time, which should be dynamic and not static. Thai scholars, on whom Dr. Rosenberg has to rely for his information, may also be responsible for this. They too sometimes speak of theatrical conventions without specifying historical contexts. However, we have good reasons to sympathize with both Dr. Rosenberg and his Thai mentors. It is extremely difficult to distinguish characteristics of the Ayuthaya Period from those of the Bangkok Period, because the deeper you probe into the past, the more you realize that primary



sources in written form are extremely scarce and sometimes non-existent. On the other hand, to what extent could one rely on foreign sources such as those of La Loubère or Bastian ?

Dr. Rosenberg is at his best, paradoxically enough, when he treats drama as literature. His study of the dramatic texts shows how much he understands and appreciates our dramatic literature. His comparison of Rama I's *Rāmakien* with that of Rama II is just one of the many examples whereby he shows his real strength as a scholar of Thai literature. By way of descriptive criticism and textual explication, he can bring home to his German readers in which way the version of Rama II is the better text for a stage-performance. His study of the recurring themes in both the *lăkhon nai* and *lăkhon nok* is extremely interesting, although he does not go as far as adopting the "archetypal" approach of modern literary criticism. Above all, Rosenberg is a first-rate translator, whether he knows it or not. His German has a very wide range: it can be simple and down-to-earth, but when the occasion demands, it can scale the heights of ceremonial solemnity. Read his translation of excerpts from the *Rāmakien* (p. 110-112), and you will find a great translator at work. There can be no question about his mastery of the Thai language. In the section on music, he renders into German those almost untranslatable titles of classical Thai melodies in such a way that would make his German and Thai readers equally happy. Try to translate something like *chui chūi* into a foreign tongue, and you will realize how difficult it is to capture the spirit of the original.

The sections on the non-literary aspects of the traditional theatre may present some difficulties to Western readers. It must be quite an ordeal trying to explain in words what *khōn* masks look like, or how one dances the *mū bot*. Dr. Rosenberg naturally has a hard time in attempting to convey to his German readers the visual and aural impressions of a theatrical performance. He himself may not have seen many of the performances he has to depict to his readers. He dwells at great length on the description of traditional musical instruments, on the ensemble-playing of a classical Thai orchestra, although it is doubtful whether he has seen a live-performance of a *lăkhon nai*. In all fairness, the reviewer must admit that Dr. Rosenberg has acquitted himself very well. He has

rare imaginative gifts. A Thai reader, who has read his description of a shadow-play performance (p.331), could almost feel the "frisson" of an actual performance. However, how many of his German readers would have the same gifts as the author? One cannot help feeling that in many instances, a picture could have done a much better job and with more economy than detailed verbal presentation. In the whole volume, there are only two rather primitive drawings of theatrical costume. But we must not forget that the book was written as a doctoral dissertation and has been published in its original form.

A good dissertation may not necessarily make a good book for a larger reading public. The reviewer would venture to say that in its present form, the book would find a very limited reading public. The theatre, of all the art-forms, is precisely the most "popular", and it would indeed be a pity if this authoritative work on Thai drama would be read only by a very small group of German Orientalists. After the success of the Fine Arts Department's performance of classical Thai drama at the 1970 Ruhr-Festspiel, it might be desirable to enlighten the German public further on the dramatic art of Thailand. This reviewer would like to recommend to the "Hamburg School" and to the author to undertake to produce a second and revised version of the book. Some of the chapters may have to be re-written in the light of more recent research, especially the chapter on music. The author has now made the necessary "field-trip" to Thailand and may have had the opportunity of meeting some experts on Thai drama. On the whole, the second edition could be a little more profane, and above all, profusely illustrated. This should not be beneath the dignity of a "scholar". As an outsider, the reviewer feels that the traditional German distinction between literary scholarship (*Literaturwissenschaft*) on the one hand, and literary criticism (*Literaturkritik*) and belles-lettres (*Belletristik*) on the other, has had pernicious effects. Why should an Orientalist not be the first to bridge the gap?

*Chetana Nagavajara*

Richard Davis: *A Northern Thai Reader* (Siam Society, Bangkok) 1970 pp. 91, 40 baht.

From time to time in northern Thailand, handbook-readers (bēp rian) on the Myang (Northern Thai, Lannathai, Yuan) script can be found for sale in local bookstores. These are generally rather slim volumes printed in limited editions and designed to stir up greater interest among northerners in this rapidly disappearing area of their traditional culture.<sup>1</sup> Mr. Davis' book, on the other hand, is the first handbook on the Myang script written primarily for westerners. Whereas the previous handbooks were organized on the traditional syllabary model, with explanations and equivalences given in Thai, *A Northern Thai Reader* uses the International Phonetic Alphabet to transcribe the Myang pronunciation of the letters.

The dialect of Myang used by Mr. Davis is that of Nan Province where he lived as a Peace Corps Volunteer. The main difference between the Nan dialect and other Myang dialects is the tonal system. Fortunately, however, the systems are mutually convertible. If the reader already speaks Myang, he can simply substitute the pronunciation of his own dialect, taking into account some regular consonant and vowel changes as well (e.g., ๑ is read as /l-/ in Nan, but /h-/ in some other dialects).

In his reader, Mr. Davis provides several charts and lists of tones, consonants, and vowels. In addition to sections on vowels, consonants (including tones) and numerals, descriptions are given of the symbols used in Indic words, special symbols and placement of letters ('flowing letters'), and irregular spellings. Twenty-eight Myang proverbs and short sentences are used as drill material in the early sections. Four reading selections and a glossary for the readings (some 400 entries) complete the book.


- 
- 1) Among such handbooks are *Bēp rian phaasāa phýyn myaŋ dūaj ton ʔeeŋ* by Phra Khruu Prasāatsūtaakhom (Chiangmai, 1952), *Bēp rian naŋsýy phýyn myaŋ nʔa* by the Khana Song of Amphur Chom Thong (Chom Thong ?, 1953), *Bēp rian naŋsýy thaj lāeʔ naŋsýy phýyn myaŋ* by Maha Insom Chaichomphu (Chiangrai, c. 1961), and *Tamraa rian naŋsýy lamathaj* by Acharn Manee Phajomjong (Chiangmai, 1968). Acharn Manee's textbook is a more substantial work (126 pp.) written to help scholars and other people interested in the epigraphy and traditional literature of northern Thailand.

Since it is obvious that the most important consideration in a language reader is the extent to which it succeeds in teaching a person to read, this reviewer worked through most of the book in a genuine effort to learn to read Myang. All but the last two reading selections were covered in approximately four and one-half hours, by which time reading was fairly accurate though not very rapid. The following comments are made in the light of this serious attempt to use Mr. Davis' book.

Although Mr. Davis does not say so, the use of only Myang script, IPA notation, and English glosses might lead one to assume that neither Thai nor Myang are prerequisites for using the reader. Without some knowledge of Myang and written Thai, however, progress would be somewhat slower than that referred to above, and some parts of the presentation might be confusing.

On the whole, Davis has organized his material well and presented it clearly. There are occasional lapses, however, which could confuse the reader, especially one not familiar with the Thai writing system. Several points may be mentioned.

1. Examples used to show how a particular rule operates sometimes contain new letters or functions of letters which are not explained until later sections, causing the reader to be puzzled over the IPA notation for the examples.

a. 'Dangerous' /*ʔónthāláaj*/ (5.2.4.1.) has several problems. First, how does one arrive at /-láaj/ for the final syllable (cf. 'hog deer' in the same section)? Second, the medial function of  and its effect on the vowel of a later syllable is not explained until 8.4. Even then, one might expect the second syllable to be /-tháa-/, following the rule which says that /aa/ occurs after 'the initial consonant of the following syllable'.

b. Fishhook' /*pālītsáʔ*/ (6.2.1.) contains a high class consonant not yet introduced. This consonant and its function as a doubled medial<sup>2</sup> is not mentioned until 6.2.2.1.

---

2) A doubled medial is a consonant symbol within a polysyllabic word which is pronounced as both the final consonant of one syllable and the initial syllable of the following syllable.

c. The vowel symbol /a/ appears to be missing in the first syllable of 'holy book' /kampii/ (6.3.1.) and 'many' /sáppā?/ (6.3.2.). Not until 6.3.3. is the use of unwritten /a/ explained.

d. 'To say, as well' /ko waa/ (8.1.) might be read as /kwaa/, following the rule about genuine consonant clusters (5.1., cf. 'more than' /kwaa/). Here, however, one would probably come up with /kā waa/ (cf. 'to do' /kātām/). The reading of ཀ as /kə/ here is irregular. Even the full form, ཀོ, found on pp. 57, line 3, is irregular. These two graphic alternants of /kə/ should have been listed with other 'irregular spellings' in 9. and used only in the reading selections.

2. Some rules are not explained as clearly as they might be.

a. The pronunciation of རྩ as /ñ/ as /n/ when in final position (cf. 'merit' /bún/ in 6.2.1.) is not explicitly stated.

b. Consonant groupings<sup>3</sup> make their appearances in various places (5.2.4.1., 5.3.2., 7.3., 8.1.) without being clearly introduced, except in the case of Indic words (6.2., 6.3.). It would have been helpful if several sections had been devoted to consonant groupings, comparing and contrasting them with clusters. Since the only genuine clusters which are reflected in the spoken language are those with /-w-/ (5.1.), all other contiguous initial consonants are either 'pseudo-clusters' or consonant groups. Pseudo-clusters are those in which one member is either ར or བ. ར adds aspiration to the other member of the pseudo-cluster and then, except with རྩ, drops. If the other member is already aspirated, ར simply drops (5.2.). In pseudo-clusters with labial or velar consonants, བ drops. All other combinations of consonants, including རྩ, རྩ, and རྩ, are treated as consonant groups. The tone of a syllable having a consonant cluster or group is determined by the class of the first (or main) consonant.

c. Another problem is that of determining the order of syllables in graphic complexes. In these complexes, several syllables all having the same initial consonant are written with a single consonant symbol

3) Two contiguous initial consonants which are not true clusters. They are read as two syllables, the unwritten vowel /a/ being used to separate them.

surrounded by the various vowels and final consonants comprising the rest of the syllables. Several examples are found in 7.1., but the most prominent example is on the title page. No statement about the order in which these syllables should be read was given.

3. The following printing errors were found and should be added to the list of those found on the errata sheet: final glottal stop /-ʔ/ is missing on /ʔi ʔu -i -i -u/ (p. 5), ๗ should be /-aj/ (5), 'to blow' should be ๒๕๖ (11), 'no' should be /bo/ (12), 'group' should be /fun/ (18), the Myang and romanized lines are reversed in 3.5.7. (25), the two Myang lines are reversed in the first proverb (30), 'place' should be /sátthaan/ (46), 'cleverness' should be /phǎñáa/ (50), and ๒๓ should be ๒๔ (57, line 6).

The Myang letters are written in by hand but are almost always clearly legible. The shapes of the letters sometimes differ slightly from those found in Acharn Manee's text or in printed handbooks, but should present no great problem to the reader.

Finally, one would like to have had more drill and reading practice material. This is probably not a serious deficiency, however, since the reader who finishes *A Northern Thai Reader* should be able to move on to use, with some facility, other Myang handbook-readers. Most of these readers use a number of nonsense syllables, proverbs, stories, and parts of sermons as drill material.

Despite the problem areas pointed out above, *A Northern Thai Reader* is a book which all those interested in the language and literature of northern Thailand will want to own and study. Mr. Davis has performed a real service in providing English-reading people with this usable introduction to the Myang script.

*Herbert C. Purnell, Jr.*

Pierre Fistié *Sous-développement et utopie au Siam* (Mouton et Cie, La Haye-Paris) 1969 pp. 254

Mr. Pierre Fistié, who has specialized in the modern history of South-East Asia and who has already published some interesting studies about Thailand, has entitled his latest work "Underdevelopment and utopia in Siam". This is somewhat misleading since Mr. Fistié limits the scope of his volume to the period of the fall of the absolute monarchy and of the setting up of the constitutional régime during which Pridi Phanomyong, one of the promoters of the 1932 revolution, drafted the radical national economic plan which is the central topic of the book.

In his first chapter, Mr. Fistié analyses the economic and political structure of Siam in 1932. He points out that a monetary economy had not yet everywhere superseded the subsistence economy which had been the rule in traditional Siam and that, owing to the small number of inhabitants, there was no demographic pressure in the country. However, the modernization of the administration by King Chulalongkorn and his successors, the increasing influence of Chinese and Western interests in everything connected with commerce and banking, and lastly the consequences of the 1929 crisis gradually created a feeling of uneasiness which was felt acutely by the group of young nationalist reformers to which Pridi Phanomyong belonged. They believed that the evolution of the country under absolute monarchical rule had been slow and timid. They condemned the anachronistic features of its political, social and economic structure and advocated a drastic programme of reforms which would reshape it along socialistic lines.

Pridi Phanomyong, who had been an exceptionally brilliant law student in Paris, exerted a strong influence on the younger segment of the Thai intelligentsia. As a member of the government formed after the 1932 revolution, he laid before the Assembly in fulfilment of the third point of the People's Party's manifesto, a "National Economic Plan" which embodied these revolutionary ideas.

In the preamble to the plan, Pridi asserted that he was not influenced by any particular social philosophy, although he was convinced that the economy of Siam would only progress if the state took charge of a national

economic plan based on the division of the economic system into separate cooperative associations. His thinking, however, derives clearly from two different sources: the doctrinal idealism of the utopian socialists and the experiments of Soviet Russia. He rejected a class war and presented himself as a reformer, largely because he was conscious of the necessity not to antagonize foreigners and the wealthy section of Siamese society. But this cautious approach did not deter him from advocating a series of radical and unrealistic measures which Mr. Fistié analyzes in detail. Pridi based the feasibility of his programme of collectivisation on the supposed ambition of all Siamese people to become government employees, on the fact that the land had always been considered as belonging exclusively to the king, and on the monolithic structure of traditional society which, apart from a small group of princes, was unaware of the concept of social differentials. It is pretty obvious that he invoked these considerations to prove that his programme, far from breaking with tradition, fitted into it and was the outcome of its natural evolution.

His basic idea, sensible in itself, was that it was necessary to free the country from the bondage of its purely agricultural condition by giving it the means of supplying itself with the manufactured goods needed for internal consumption. Agriculture would have to be collectivized and mechanized to free a large number of people from their work in the fields and employ them in factories. A "National Economic Council" would control and direct the economy and a National Bank would take charge of all the banking activities of the country. In some of his suggestions, Pridi was going further than the Soviets and presaged Mao Tse Tung; in some others, not without contradiction, he tried to reconcile his socialistic system with a degree of developmental autonomy. He later pointed out this ambiguity to defend himself from being accused of communism.

The economic project was coolly received by the commission which had been formed to study it. Opposition, which had been voiced in strong terms by the most important members of that body, was shared by many ministers in the cabinet; it was to find its most influential supporter in King Prajadhipok, a very cultivated and experienced person, who took the trouble to write down his comments on each paragraph in Pridi's text. Mr. Fistié has included both documents at the end of his book and



they illustrate it in a vivid way. The confrontation of the doctrinal radicalism of the young and brilliant statesman with the seasoned, somewhat sceptical wisdom of the monarch is most enlightening, not only because it has played a role in the shaping of the future of the country, but also because it shows two opposing attitudes towards the problems of government.

Phya Phahon took control of the government in 1933, and adopted a strong anti-communist stand, obliging Pridi to withdraw from political activity. However, the latter answered in such moderate terms the commission which had been formed in 1934 to question him, that his good faith as a moderate reformist, a respecter of law, individual freedom and private property was recognized and Phya Phahon himself appointed him Minister of the Interior a little later.

The importance of Pridi's project is more historical than political. What remains of it in present day Thailand is small and has no relation with its socialistic origins. Pridi had advocated a system of indirect taxation, which he introduced in 1939 and which is still in force. Moreover, the government, urged by its desire to diversify the economic activities of the country, has created some state industries. This initiative, which fitted in with Pridi's views, was, however, not motivated by reason of principle. It simply appeared as necessary because the government could rely neither on private capital nor on individual enterprise to produce the results it sought.

Curiously enough, it is in Communist China that the collectivization of agriculture, as envisaged by Pridi, was first put in practice. From that point of view, his project of 1933 may be considered as a forerunner. It was certainly the first attempt to build up a coordinated body of reforms aiming at a thorough reconstruction of the state based on new principles to appear in the Far East.

*Achille Clarac*

David Wilson: *The United States and the Future of Thailand* (Praeger, New York, 1970), pp. 187 \$7.50.

Scholars who have been well-acquainted with some of Professor Wilson's works, particularly his masterpiece, *Politics in Thailand* which remains one of the best theses on Thailand by foreigners, will find much disappointment awaiting them in the volume under review. For this recent study contains hardly anything new. One is tempted to conclude that Professor Wilson must have been urged on to produce this book, *The United States and the Future of Thailand* by the trends of the period. The theme, at least, sharply points to this direction. It is strikingly similar to the contents of the works of D.E. Neuchterlein, *Thailand and the Struggle for South East Asia* (1965); D. Wit *Thailand - Another Vietnam?* (1968). Yet it seems that Professor Wilson has not managed to present his view as clearly, as specifically as the other two authors have done. Moreover the title of this book rather misrepresents its contents. It deals mainly with the history of the region, i.e. South-East Asia, in connexion with Western imperialism in general, and the history of the relations between the United States and Thailand in particular. Only the last of the nine chapters offers to touch the topic of the "Future of Thailand". Even then it is dodgily analysed. The solution, consequently, appears lightweight especially to Thai readers for whom the book leaves much to be desired.

The disappointment nonetheless cannot be considered entirely the fault on Professor Wilson's part. *The U.S. and the Future of Thailand* is written not for scholars of this field; rather it is an attempt to explain to the Americans who have, since the full vista of the unhappy Vietnam War has imposed itself on them, been most bewildered by the extent of this unnecessary entanglement (Introduction p. 3: "How did the U.S. get involved in South-East Asia? Is the cost of this involvement worth the benefits to be gained from it? . . ."). In this light, the book gives an outline of American commitments in South-East Asia—a natural consequence of an ideological struggle of the cold war. Professor Wilson has aimed through this book to assuage the agony, the anxiety and the anger caused by the U.S.' entangled role in Vietnam, and to suppress the apprehension that a close tie with any other country in this region, e.g. Thailand, would

mean "another Vietnam". On the contrary Professor Wilson is convinced that a "better future" may be had if the U.S. can form a close and cordial tie with a strong nation in this area.

What is now demanded of Washington is that it must be more constructive in its programmes to assist all junior allies in their efforts to develop their communities—militarily, economically and socially.

As such *The U.S. and the Future of Thailand* has partially achieved the goal its author has set himself.

Since chapter IX contains most of the answers to the questions asked in the introduction, it should be read with careful attention. After relating the whole history of the U.S. in Asia and South-East Asia and the attitude of the South-East Asian countries towards the Western Powers and towards the U.S. (chapter I), and the history of the U.S.-Thai relations with a birdseye study of Thailand's political, economic, social, strategic and international positions (chapter II-VII), Professor Wilson turns to emphasise the important role played by the U.S. in influencing the political and social development in Thailand through various forms of aid given to the Thai Government (chapter VIII). He also sees that Thailand is qualified for a proper place in the present world order mapped out by the U.S. which is beneficial to U.S. prestige and strategic strength (chapter IX, p. 164). Thailand is of great significance to the U.S. because Washington's basic thesis is "to stop China expanding into South-East Asia". In this way of thinking, Thailand's strengthened position, compared with other states in the region, provides the U.S. with a "centre" of "an orderly and self-perpetuating" South-East Asia to stop Chinese and Vietnamese expansion.

There exists however, and Professor Wilson is quite honest in pointing this out, a possibility that Thailand may be excluded from the future line of defence, once the basic U.S. reason for staying in South-East Asia changes. The Thai Government has been aware of this uncertainty, but Professor Wilson fails to point out effectively Bangkok's reaction, particularly after the series of heavy attacks delivered by the U.S. Congress and the American press in the late 60's. For example, its insistence on "Thai-ism" as the key to the future of Thai foreign policy, and its intense

interest in regional co-operation. Though the U.S. may exercise a great influence on Thailand's internal and external policies, it is fair to say that Bangkok's bargaining power is reasonable in influencing the U.S. attitude in South-East Asia; take for example, the Rusk-Khoman Communiqué of 1962, and the favourable exception to the rule of the Thai position vis-à-vis the Guam Doctrine 1969. To a Thai reader "The Future of Thailand" does not seem to depend on the U.S., at least not as much as Professor Wilson believes.

There appears some incorrect information, notably about the South-East Asia League of 1947 (p. 30 and 53). Wilson regards this regional effort at its face value, i.e. as an organisation for "regional co-operation... based in Bangkok" against "the return of French or British colonialism". John Coast revealed quite a time ago the true nature of this League, which he considered his own brain child, in *Recruit for Revolution* (p.52). Professor Wilson has also omitted one major factor from his list of important institutions integrating the Thai Society, namely the Crown. The omission comes as a surprise since to those who are acquainted with Thailand the essential role performed by the present King in holding the people together is self-evident

It is typical of Professor Wilson to produce out of this mediocre study some truth-telling analyses on Thailand and her social and political system. Outstanding among them is his explanation of the Thai Government's sensitivity to any sign of rebellion, real or imaginary, and its seemingly exaggerated reaction to such a rumour. "Rebellion is an authentically Thai style of politics. Therefore the Thai Government has been adequately impressed by such a threat..." (p.59). He likewise gives a valuable judgment on the Thai national characteristics: "the Thai people, even the educated classes, are not an ideological people", but rather "a pragmatic (and)... a moral people" which makes leadership very essential. It means that the political stability is "genuine" but paradoxically "fragile". (p. 97). There is much truth in his observation.

Professor Wilson also poses a very interesting question: "Is Thailand a virulent military dictatorship?" (p. 129). Perhaps the most interesting observation in *The U.S. and the Future of Thailand* is his profound

understanding of Thailand's socio-political conflict (p. 133). Here Professor Wilson pointedly analyses an enormous problem facing the Thai people: a conflict between the Thai aspiration to political freedom, i.e. the rule of the people, and their economic needs, i.e. a firm governing hand to hasten economic growth. So politically Thailand is to be ruled by the democratic system; but economically she should be under an authoritarian government which could assure the people of social order. "Democracy, with its tendencies towards disorder, is (therefore) seen as threatening, if not inimical, to the process of development." A reader is compelled to realise the complicated nature of Thai society which goes deeper than the power-struggle level.

*The U.S. and the Future of Thailand* is only a short dissertation catering for a limited audience, i.e. the Americans disturbed by the Vietnam War. Because of this limitation the book can be nothing but mediocre in quality.

*Kobkua Suwannathat*

*Education in Thailand: A Century of Experience* (The Department of Elementary and Adult Education, Ministry of Education, Thailand) 1970, pp. 142.

That the education system in Thailand leaves much to be desired is due not only to the fact that it is an under-developed country, but also that it is in general far from easy to effect good planning in education. As M.L. Boonlua Dhebyasuwan has pointed out, education planning is difficult, one often unrealised factor being that it takes something in the order of twenty-five years to know whether or not the planning will prove successful. Society changes its character so much within that span of time that it is almost impossible to project accurately the types of citizen the education system of today should produce. The Department of Elementary and Adult Education of the Ministry of Education is therefore to be congratulated for its attempt to learn from past experience in order to gain a sense of proper direction for the present education system. The collected papers and discussions from the seminar entitled "Lessons

derived from a *Century of Experience in Thai Education*" has been published in Thai under the same title, and in English under the title "*Education in Thailand: A Century of Experience*" in a shortened form containing only the papers presented. Four out of ten contributors, including the Minister, are from the Ministry of Education. All but one are civil servants. The volume therefore reflects to a large extent the official views of the Ministry of Education on their own domain. There is also a relatively minor contribution from the National Education Council.

Tej Bunnag surveys the period of 1820-1920 (King Nangklao to King Wachirawut) which saw the threat of western colonialism and simultaneous westernisation of many aspects of Thai society. The traditional form of education with the central role played by the monastery evolved into a "modern" system, centralised and bureaucratic, which has persisted up to the present time. The reign of King Chulalongkorn stands out as the crucial turning point. It may be noted that while he broadened the Thai concept of education enormously by, for example, establishing the first school run by lay teachers and giving impetus to the foundation of university education, his immediate objective was to produce competent government officials. As Ekavidya Nathalang points out in the concluding article "... This aim persisted down to the present time with a constantly high priority". While one may therefore acclaim the years under King Chulalongkorn as the golden era of educational reform, it is regrettable that this reform has not been carried on beyond the initial objective, which at present proves to be more a burden than a support for further advancement of our educational system.

The next three articles concern the interaction of education with social and economic structure, technology, and culture respectively. All three contributors discuss the nature of these subjects *per se* rather than their interaction with education. The lack of balance can, however, be excused for the reason that they provide the background for further discussion, which educationists might otherwise need. Sanoh Unakul relates an account of social and economic change during the past century, dividing Thai economic history into two main periods, the pre- and the post- World War II. In the final paragraphs he challenges educationists.

to solve pertinent problems, such as the conveyance of agricultural information to farmers, lack of cooperation and communication among specialists, and ignorance of lay people of their rights and duties in society. Charoon Wongsayan discusses various aspects of modern technology, and sounds a word of caution that technological change need not necessarily bring progress to mankind in general and to the education of mankind in particular. This quite justified warning seems to be based, however, on the common misconception that technology by itself causes degradation of human ethical values and traditional religion can reverse the effect. Unfortunately the interplay of various sociological factors is far from being that simple. Kukrit Pramoj realises the complexity of society as expressed in the form of culture. Deeming that culture is a self-propagating force, he takes a pessimistic view that education can have very little influence on the course of cultural change. The despair is unnecessary, as the author himself a few paragraphs earlier has suggested a means of injecting cultural awareness into the young by integrating this into various subjects taught at school.

An important question considered by Amara Raksasat in "The Evolution of Educational Administrative Organization" is centralization versus decentralization. The trend up to now has been toward monopoly by governmental bodies: the National Education Council controls the broad policy while the Ministry of Education controls the functioning of all schools. In the next twenty years the sheer weight of work will cause the pendulum to swing towards decentralization. Under the same heading, Swat Chongkol studies the history of Thai education right from the Lanna Thai and Sukhothai periods up to the present. Development within the past hundred years is considered in detail with little comment. The next two articles are on national education plans by Sukich Nimmanheminda, and evolution in curriculum and teaching by Aree Sanhachawee. The former contains only brief sketchy comments, while in the latter can be found interesting accounts on teaching methods of some prominent teachers from the past.

The most controversial article in the book is by Saroj Buasri, proposing "a new concept of education for Thailand". Realizing that we now live in the post-moon-landing period, the author looks forward to ever faster changes. In order to be able to control the changes it is necessary to scrutinize the various foundations of education, especially

the philosophical foundation. The author believes that Thailand should have an educational philosophy of her own and, since the majority of the people are Buddhists, that it should be based on Buddhist principles. Proceeding from this logic, the author explains basic Buddhist concepts which would prove useful as foundation stones for the new educational philosophy, identifying wherever possible these concepts with those from Western philosophy. While it may be beneficial to apply Buddhist teachings toward building an educational philosophy, to this reviewer it seems doubtful if these alone are sufficient on which to build the whole philosophy, especially in this post-moon-landing period. (A similar caution was noted by Wijit Srisa-arn in the discussion following the paper.) Moreover, one should not confuse a philosophy with a system. While Thailand may have an educational system peculiar to itself, there is no reason why it must have a unique educational philosophy. The latter should be universal, not local.

The seminar was summarised effectively by Ekavidhya Nathalang.

*Yongyuth Yuthavong*

Sumet Jumsai *Seen: Architectural forms of Northern Siam and Old Siamese Fortifications* (Thai Wattana Panich for The Fine Arts Commission and the Association of Siamese Architects, Bangkok 1970), pp. 41 text, pp. 156 illus. 250 baht.

A volume from a young practicing architect as much in the public eye as Dr. Sumet Jumsai leads one to expect a great deal. But the author-architect candidly tells us at the beginning that the text consists exclusively of notes written during a "hectic journey" that took in 19 towns and sites between 20 June and 3 July 1965 and another 4 day trip in 1969 to 4 more; Lopburi and Nakorn Srithammaraj (here Nakhōwn Sīdhamarāch) are thrown in for good measure, and Ayuthia is marked on the map as visited but not written about in the text or illustrated. Intending to write up the notes into a proper study, he admits to having been overtaken by "other projects and activities" and presents the notes as they are.



In many ways it is a great pity Dr. Sumet could not find the time to do a serious study correlating "the interplay of architectural expression, urban form and symbolism" in Siam, for few people are better qualified than he to do so, and his hasty notes, often illuminating as they are, are nonetheless an inadequate substitute for the depth of approach the subject requires, as he himself implies. There are also surprising gaps: no mention is made of the city wall of Srisachanalai (though there is one photograph of it) and Lampang Luang was missed "because the visit to Lampang was short".

The jottings then are rough notes to amplify the illustrations, which, as the title of the book indicated, are divided into two sections; the first is almost exclusively devoted to temples and the second to city walls. Here inevitably there are lacunae and it is presumably a matter of what Dr. Sumet had time to see in the 18 days at his disposal to visit 25 towns, and what came out of the camera successfully. The author has not been well-served by his printer, for there is a uniform dull greyness about every illustration caused by insufficient chiaroscuro. In close-ups this does not matter much, but the fortifications come out particularly poorly. All this is disappointing, for Dr. Sumet is making a visual point which deserves pictorial clarity.

It is difficult therefore to know by what standards to judge the book. Most architects' marginalia are only printed when the authors are world famous or dead (e.g. Leonardo or Le Corbusier -- "Corbu" to the author), and Dr. Sumet is very much alive. He would probably not wish to have the volume categorised as coffee-table literature, but the slender somewhat insubstantial text ranks it thus; yet the quality of the photographic reproduction and the numerous typographical errors let it down on this score. Attractive as the form might appear, it is no substitute for "a systematic study of the intended subject" which the author admits to setting out to do originally. Let us hope that Dr. Sumet can take time off from his other projects and activities and, without further "years of procrastination" settle down to produce the definitive texts on the two subjects put together in this volume.

*Michael Smithies*

Gordon H. Luce: *Old Burma—Early Pagán* (*Artibus Asiae*, Supplementum 25, Locust Valley, N.Y.) 1969, 1970. Vol. I, Text, pp. xviii, 422; vol. II, Catalogue of Plates, Indexes, pp. 337, maps and plans; vol. III, Plates, 455 plates. \$120.

The long-awaited *Old Burma—Early Pagán* is a book on a grand scale, a scale not often met with these days but entirely appropriate to the super-human aura that surrounds its author, Gordon H. Luce. Mr. Luce is the last of the great scholars produced by the Empire. His interests are encyclopedic, his erudition vast. *Old Burma—Early Pagán* is the product of a lifetime of study, and Mr. Luce refers in it to notes made fifty years ago. He can turn out a sentence, moreover, so full of crusty elegance and of love for his subject that we can only stand in awe of him: "A few big trees, tamarind and Indian elm and bombaz," for instance, he writes of the plain around Pagán, "tower magnificent where there is subsoil water; also the toddy-palm, palmyra; and some of the humbler plants flower prettily enough, but are too dry for fodder, or exude blistering milk or sticky stain, or put forth pincer-thorns or little caltrop heads with barbs." The monuments and history of this not entirely hospitable plain are the subject of *Old Burma—Early Pagán*.

The text volume is divided into three sections, on the history of early Pagán (the second half of the eleventh century, that is, through the middle of the twelfth, when, according to Mr. Luce, Singhalese influence became more important than Mon), on the iconography of statuary and mural paintings, and on the architecture of the temples, respectively. The historical chapters include a number of new interpretations and supplant everything else written on the subject. The chapters on the art, together with the illustrations, incorporate material published during this century in the *Archaeological Survey of India* and the *Archaeological Survey of Burma* and now obtainable only in the great libraries, but the great bulk of the illustrations and Mr. Luce's ordering of the accumulated knowledge into a comprehensive whole are new. The author gives us a picture of early Pagán which is dependent not only on his own previously published work and that of others but on primary material—such as the inscriptions on votive tablets from the 'Chitsagôn' mound—presented here for the first time.

Important as *Old Burma—Early Pagán* is and as indispensable as it will always remain, the book clarifies—as indeed it should—those areas in which work needs to be done. In the first place, only a very few inscriptions have been edited and translated, and many of Mr. Luce's conclusions are based on his knowledge of material in inscriptions of which only plates have been published (these plates being obtainable only in a handful of libraries). Pagán will become an open field for historians of religion, art, politics, and social life only when epigraphists and philologists give us reliable transcriptions and translations of all the inscriptions, such as we have for Cambodia. Secondly, the religious history of Pagán remains enigmatic and will become less so only when the inscriptions and the iconographic schemes of the temples are analyzed for themselves, rather than ascribed to such uncertain categories as "Tāntric-Mahāyānist of the Bengal School" when, to use the Abēyadana as an example, only a tiny proportion of the scenes and figures in the murals have been identified. Sarkisyanz's *Buddhist Backgrounds of the Burmese Revolution* shows what insights can arise when the material is studied empathetically, and analyses more rigorous and detailed should tell us not only what and how the Burmese themselves thought but how their religious concepts were related to the varied sects of northern India (cf. Paul Mus, *La Lumière sur les Six Voies*). Lastly, it would be a mistake to assume that the chronology of the monuments, as presented by Mr. Luce, is fixed once and for all time. In order to date the temples, Mr. Luce uses all the resources at his command—none more brilliantly, perhaps, than the analysis of the spelling of the Old Mon glosses on the murals (though even there the source material needed for an independent check is not always available). There is little that is absolutely certain, however, and a doubt is even raised concerning the originality of the inscription at the most securely dated temple, the Shwégu-gyi of 1131 A.D. The problem of the possibility of later restorations and alterations is not really brought up. Nevertheless there are no obvious holes in Mr. Luce's scheme; his comments on style are sensitive and apt, and it is hardly likely that any re-adjustment, if it occurs, will be on the scale of the revolution effected by Philippe Stern for Khmer art. For the present, any art historian who wishes to study the evolution of the architecture of Pagán will be, like all of us, not only in Mr. Luce's debt but dazzled by the light of his example.

Hiram W. Woodward, Jr.

Cambodia needs to be written on its own terms rather than from the point of view of one more or less imperial power or another. Since M.L. Manich's own biases are rooted largely in historical myths (e.g. the "Khom" at Angkor, and the "loss" of Battambang) they have to a large extent overpowered his capacity to write Cambodia's history in a way that would be helpful to readers in Thailand and elsewhere.

*David P. Chandler*

M.L. Manich Jumsai, *A History of Anglo-Thai Relations* (Chalermnit, Bangkok), 1970 pp. 296 illus. U.S. \$7.50

A veteran world traveller, M.L. Manich Jumsai is equally at home in his native Thailand, and in the Western capitals. In recent years, he has attempted to share his intimate knowledge of both worlds with the reading public. Having already written several books, his latest work, *A History of Anglo-Thai Relations*, appeared in October, 1970. M.L. Manich's book is an interesting addition to the previously published English-language literature, as it discusses contact between the two countries from a decidedly Thai point of view, while utilizing primarily European sources.

*A History of Anglo-Thai Relations* gives a broad survey of the contact between the two nations, from its beginnings in the early Ayutthaya period, until the present day. Comprehensive coverage of such an extensive period of time is, of course, impossible in a single volume, and M.L. Manich wisely concentrates on developments during the reigns of Rama IV and Rama V. After describing the various British embassies, including those of Crawford, Burney, Bowring, and Parkes, the book goes on to discuss the situation after the establishment of permanent British consular representation in Bangkok. The author is particularly struck by the divergence between official London policy, and its reinterpretations by the British consuls resident in Siam. M.L. Manich sees the consuls, and particularly Knox, as personal adventurers, whose deeds did more to hurt Anglo-Thai relations than help them.

Nowhere is the discrepancy more pronounced than in the situation of Chieng Mai. The teak forests of the North were a source of tremendous wealth, and as their Burmese subjects expanded operations into the region, the British sought increased privileges not only for the Burmese, but for themselves as well. Despite his sending of gold and silver trees to Bangkok, the Prince of Chieng Mai had almost complete control over the region. The London Foreign Office chose to regard Chieng Mai as a vassal of Thailand, and dealt with the prince's often capricious policies through the central Siamese state. The consuls, however, were often determined to reverse this policy (in order to increase their own positions) and periodically demanded the establishment of separate relations with Chieng Mai. While pressing for increased extraterritorial privileges, London never acquiesced to the consuls' demands. M.L. Manich considers the entire Chieng Mai affair to be an unjust attack on the Thai government, and an expression of the extreme opportunism of the local British representatives. In order to accentuate the difficulties and divergences of opinion presented by this situation, the author prints *in toto* the texts of various accords relating to the North, including the Treaty of 1874, the Treaty of 1883, revising the previous one, and the trade convention of 1880.

While the book considers many of the salient problems of the period, the author seems to be unaware of other research done in related fields. Perhaps the best example of this can be seen in the book's handling of the *Wang Na*, or Front Palace Incident of 1874-75. Its importance has only been recognized in recent years, and cannot be overstated. The event was a major confrontation between King Chulalongkorn and the older elements in the government, here represented by the "Prince of the Front Palace", Prince Wichaichan. The Front Palace incident resulted in the explosion of many inner tensions nascent in the Regency, and pointed to the precarious position of the King himself. Although King Chulalongkorn "won", several scholars are currently studying the incident in an effort to determine its effect on the young monarch, and on the pace of his program of reform.

In order to understand fully the situation, let us consider some background information. Appointed "Prince of the Front Palace" by the same committee which ratified the choice of Prince Chulalongkorn as King, Prince Wichaichan was closely linked to the older elements in court,

and particularly to the Regent, Chaophraya Si Suriyawong. Relations between the King and the Prince were always strained, and relatively distant familial ties did little to ease the situation. Feeling personally threatened by King Chulalongkorn, Prince Wichaichan secretly built up a considerable personal army, which was garrisoned in his palace, presently the site of the National Museum. On the night of 28-29 December, 1874, a fire of highly suspicious origin broke out in a critical area of the Grand Palace, only a short distance away. A contingent of fully armed soldiers was sent by the Prince, ostensibly to help quell the blaze. They were forcibly turned away at the gate. The appearance of armed men only exacerbated the already tense situation, and even though the ex-Regent was called in from Ratburi to assist in finding a solution, Prince Wichaichan fled to the British consulate. Assured by Newman, the Acting Consul, of British support, Prince Wichaichan refused to leave the consulate. It was only when Sir Andrew Clarke came from Singapore that the situation was resolved. Clarke refused to intervene directly, preferring to view the situation as a family conflict. As can be seen in his memoranda to London, some of which are contained in the book under review, Clarke was most concerned with maintaining political and economic stability. Thus, his decisions strengthened the position of King Chulalongkorn, and hence the unity of the central government in Bangkok. Despite its positive outcome, the events of early 1875 had a profound effect on the young king, and his program of reform lay dormant for nearly a decade. Moreover, at its zenith, the Front Palace incident foreboded partition of Siam, and direct foreign intervention.<sup>1</sup>

M.L. Manich has made a wise choice in mentioning this incident, and particularly in presenting a wide assortment of relevant documents. Although most of them have been published elsewhere, this is a convenient and readily available collection. In future editions, however, one hopes that the author will devote more time to interpreting the importance of these documents, and to evaluating them critically. In the present volume, only one paragraph is given as an introduction to the

1) For a more detailed analysis of the *Wang Na* incident, the reader is referred to David K. Wyatt's *The Politics of Reform in Thailand* (New Haven and London, Yale University Press, 1969), especially pages 58-61. The above summary is based on that account,

texts themselves. The author does not discuss the long range implications of the incident, both as a statement of British intention to stay out of Siamese internal affairs, and as an important event in the life of young King Chulalongkorn. A serious factual error occurs here, and this, too, should be corrected in the future. The "Prince of the Front Palace" is referred to as the King's brother. He was not a brother, but a cousin, and this helps to account for some of the personal distance between them.

M.L. Manich concludes the book with an explanation of Thai foreign policy during the Second World War. He compassionately tells of the problems faced by Southeast Asians as the Japanese advanced, and explains the Thai "declaration of war" against Britain and the United States in detail. In order to satisfy the Japanese, the Bangkok government joined the war on the side of Japan. Thai ministers in the West refused to accept the document, and thus initiated one of the most unusual diplomatic actions of the period: while the government in Bangkok was officially at war, the government representatives abroad were not. The Americans accepted the position of M.R. Seni Pramoj, Ambassador to Washington, that the declaration was not the will of the Thai people. Officially the proclamation was ignored. The British recognized the declaration, but, until the end of the fighting, did little else. M.L. Manich spends much time explaining this strange situation, and the reader cannot help but sympathize with the Free Thai Movement. The author praises the Americans who recognized the Thai predicament, but is particularly harsh on the British, who, he feels, tried to exploit the post-war situation, and Thailand's status as a "loser," for their own financial gain.

The author's stated aim has been the encouragement of mutual understanding between East and West. He also wants to make the Thais more conscious of their role in the historical process. In attempting to redefine the roles played by the English and French in Asia, M.L. Manich tends to overstate his case. The result is a sharply dichotomized interpretation of events, with the Thais represented as the completely innocent victims of European chauvinism and commercial interests. That the Europeans were ruthless in the pursuit of their own goals is a statement of fact. Nonetheless, Anglo-Thai relations should not be depicted as a confrontation between the forces of good and evil.

Despite its shortcomings, *A History of Anglo-Thai Relations* makes several new contributions to the study of Thailand's foreign affairs. Not the least of these is M.L. Manich's use of the newly-discovered files of Prince Prisdang, found in the Thai Embassy in London. Thai history is an ever-growing field, and it is only through the work of a variety of scholars that historians can continue to define the nation's past. This reviewer hopes that in future editions the author will rely less on reprinting documents, and devote more time to critically examining their contents and relating them to other events in the kingdom.

*Adèle Epstein*

ed. Tej Bunnag and Michael Smithies *In Memoriam Phya Anuman Rajadhon* (The Siam Society, Bangkok) 1970, pp. 397 pp. 69 illus. 150 baht (bound) 120 baht (paperback).

This collection of articles—which contains contributions on the education, literature, anthropology, history, art, and cartography of Thailand and Southeast Asia, and also some contributions that defy classification and are grouped under the heading “personal views”—was issued by the Siam Society in memory of its one-time president. I am sure that Phya Anuman would have liked it. He would have enjoyed the rich diversity of topics, which mirrors the rich diversity of Phya Anuman's own thoughts and writings on Thai culture.

It would be a hopeless task for me to try to make meaningful comments on all twenty-three articles published here; I think it will be best if I confine my remarks to some of the longer articles that are most closely related to my own interests and experience.

The longest article, and one of the most valuable, is by that admirable team of A.B. Griswold and Prasert na Nagara who in recent years have been contributing so many fine analyses of Thai inscriptional sources. This article concerns the great engineering feat of moving the colossal statue of the reclining Buddha at Wat Pa Mok during the reign of King Thai Sa (1709-1733). The drama of moving the sacred image, an image the monks of the time declared to be “already the Lord Buddha” from



the eroding river bank is well conveyed by the article and the accompanying translations of six Thai texts. Another long article, by Clare Rosenfield, on the familiar gilt statues, usually incorrectly called *kinnari*, that surround the platform of the Prasat Phra Thepphabidon at Wat Phrakaeo presents intriguing hypotheses regarding Thai mythology and iconography. The "past splendour and unique aquatic setting" of Ayutthaya is the subject of a careful analysis by Sumet Jumsai, who helps bring to life a constantly changing city, with its complex grid of canals, its many bridges, streets, and buildings, now mostly gone. A unique map of Thailand north of Ayutthaya is given painstaking scrutiny by Victor Kennedy, who concludes that it was compiled from military information obtained during the Thai-Lao campaign of 1827. In the field of anthropology Jane Bunnag contributes a study of the relations between Buddhist monks and laymen, and concludes that the social bonds between an individual monk and lay persons depend on the initiative of the laymen and these bonds tend to become attenuated in time. Among the many shorter articles there is a brief history by David Wyatt of an early Western-style school, Ban Phraya Nana; a small gem by Prince Wan on Thai word coinage; a thoughtful survey by Kachorn Sukhabanij of proto-Thai history as revealed by Chinese sources; an account by Charles Keyes of the discovery of a new cache of Buddhist documents near Mae Sariang; and a personal appreciation by William Bradley of Buddhism as a religion that does not impose the burden of guilt on its adherents. Other articles, all of them informative and useful, are by S. Singaravelu, Karuna and Ruengurai Kusalasaya, Udom Warotamasikkkhadit and David Londe, Vichin Panupong, Prince Dhani Nivat, Jeremy Kemp, William and Kampan Klausner, Gordon Luce, Stephen Greene, Charles Spinks, Hans Penth, and Lucien and Jane Hanks.

While all the articles are presented as tribute to Phya Anuman, some specifically refer to the *chao khun's* achievements. For me the most telling comment was Sulak Sivaraksa's statement that "a life such as his makes us feel proud to be Thai." May I add, in paraphrase, that a life such as his makes me proud of mankind.

*Walter F. Vella*

John Bryant *Health & the Developing World* (Cornell University Press, Ithaca & London) 1969 pp. 345 US\$ 10.

This book is essential for everyone who is interested or concerned with health problems in developing countries. Most of the book is written in a clear, simple, and easy-to-understand language. Thai readers can learn a lot more about Thailand's important health problems in comparison with other nation's problems. The author was a member of a Rockefeller Foundation team which visited 21 developing countries in Africa, Latin America, and Asia. This survey team collected a tremendous amount of national health data from various Ministries of Health or analogous organizations. The author looked very closely at the health problems of individual emerging nations and how they tried to solve their problems both in urban and rural areas. The role of the universities as producers of health workers was also examined. The reader obtains a broad view of different types of health care systems, the complex interrelationship of local health needs, provision of medical care, and education of health personnel.

The book is divided into ten chapters. The main theme focuses on the provision of effective health care for all people concerned. In every developing nation visited, it was found that the majority of people still received very little care or none at all. Only a few, more fortunate persons in urban areas were taken care of medically in the best traditions. Solutions must be found which will enable countries to provide effective health care for the mass of people in rural areas. Although there are many advances in medical knowledge and technical capability in the western world, it is very difficult to implement this knowledge in the developing rural setting. There are many obstacles, including scarcity of resources, especially money and manpower, gaps in therapeutic knowledge, poor planning and management of the health programs etc. Shortage of funds is very important in the developing world because money shapes the design and extent of health services, the roles of the health personnel and their education. The author emphasizes the importance of investment in human resources and how health development relates very closely to national development. It is very difficult

for a poor country with a low national income to increase its health expenditure and expand health services. Moreover, other factors such as politics and socio-cultural patterns of the people also have a profound influence on disease problems.

Despite the lack of resources and many obstacles listed above, Dr. Bryant feels that developing countries could give better health care for their people. He suggests that, first, health services should take care of all people in the community and establish a close and trusted relationship with local people. Health programs should be planned in such a way as to reach everyone who needs services, but focusing on those with the greatest risk. The concept of the "health team" consisting of medical, paramedical, and auxiliary health personnel has to be used. Auxiliary health workers should have more training and be given more responsibilities in the diagnosis and treatment of diseases under the supervision of physicians and nurses. Physicians should play the role of the team leaders, administrators, and consultants; they should not waste their time doing anything that the paramedical or auxiliary health workers could do effectively. The roles and training of various types of health workers are discussed in great detail. Modern administrative ideas such as system analysis, cost-benefit concepts etc. should be used in all health planning processes in order to minimize mistakes and inefficiency. Although the author proposes a common solution, he adds that different countries will need different approaches because of political and socio-cultural differences.

Dr. Bryant further stresses that universities have to get involved in health affairs if it is hoped to see significant changes in the pattern of health care in the near future. The approach is to get various faculties, such as those for medicine, nursing, public health and dentistry, working very closely with Ministry of Health or related health agencies and use part of the normal existing health services for teaching, training, and doing research. If this were done, the universities would produce health personnel who would meet the health needs of the people and fit themselves well in the existing system of health care. Lastly, the author mentions the roles of many donor agencies such as international

foundations, churches and others, which can help develop and strengthen teaching institutions.

This book follows Maurice King's volume (*Medical Care in Developing Countries*, Oxford University Press, 1966) in giving a broad view of health problems around the world and succeeds in making readers think about similar health problems in their own countries and how they should be solved. The book is somewhat too long to be read for pleasure and many parts could profitably be shortened. The problems illustrated are quite often clinically or disease-oriented. Furthermore many important aspects of public health work are not adequately touched or described. Right from the beginning it is obvious the volume is written by a clinician. The author's concepts and ideas are, however, clearly presented. In this reviewer's experience, there is much here that is relevant to our situation in Thailand. We are facing similar problems as other developing nations. The most important thing is to know which are priority health problems and how to solve them. Every year, hundreds of Thai people die from preventable diseases. There are still big problems in extending adequate health services into rural areas because of the lack of health personnel and money. Rural people still prefer quacks and traditional midwives to modern, well-trained physicians and other health workers. There is a reluctance among higher authorities to give more training and responsibility to auxiliary health workers though we can produce only 350 MD's yearly. The brain drain and the population explosion further complicate the health manpower problem. Dr. Bryant mentions a big gap, a communications failure, between users (Ministries of Health) and producers (universities). This gap certainly exists in Thailand. We are not producing the right kind of health workers for the users. The users and the producers need to get together and produce the kind of health workers which will satisfy our national needs. Thailand now is facing all the problems listed by Dr. Bryant and will do so for years to come. How are we going to approach these problems? A reading of this book gives many new, exciting ideas for possible solutions.

*Debhanom Muangman*

ed. Schweinfurth *Jahrbuch des Südasiens-Instituts der Universität Heidelberg Band III* – Yearbook of the South Asia Institute Heidelberg University 1968/69 (Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden) 1969 pp. 138

The papers assembled in this volume, the third in a series, come under the general heading of "Problems of Land Use in Southeast Asia". The 13 papers presented, in addition to the preface, represent Interdisciplinary Seminars held in Heidelberg during the year 1968/69. Some papers are in English, others are in German. Those in German have brief summaries in English.

The subjects involved in the individual papers cover a wide range. The articles, for purposes of this review, may be divided into the following categories: 1) four short reports on activities of some of the staff members in the field, 2) six papers covering a range of subject matter ranging from the usefulness of aerial surveys, the influence of man on the distribution of forested areas in Afghanistan, the effects of human population on the forests of the Indian Sub-Continent, the climate and crops in the highlands of Ceylon, agricultural colonization in Kapatangan Basin, Mindanao and pyrethrum cultivation attempts in eastern New Guinea and 3) a group of three papers dealing with shifting cultivation; one with East Pakistan Chittagong Hill Tracts and two papers concerning shifting cultivation in Thailand.

H.Th. Verstappen in his paper, the first of the six on assorted subjects, calls attention to the great advantages available to rural development studies to be found in aerial surveys. Erosion studies, land use, irrigation plans and crop rotation studies are cited, among others, as problems whose understanding and solution could be markedly enhanced by such aerial survey techniques.

In the paper on the distribution of forests, xeromorphous woodlands and the tree communities in Afghanistan, Carl Rathjens describes studies of economic utilization and portrays rather graphically with transects and photographs the reduction in area of these woodlands. From his studies of the distribution of coniferous forests and semi-arid tree communities, the author concludes that if the present trend continues Afghanistan will become a region of steppes and deserts even as it is often described and understood to be today.

Calling on more than 50 years of observation and work in India, Sir Harry G. Champion describes with considerable pessimism the effects of human population on the forests of the Indian subcontinent. Observations over the years of the important forests at low elevations in the drainage area of the Ganges Basin composed predominantly of a single tree species, *Dipterocarp Shorea robusta* (sal) provide evidence that many of the substantial area tracts of sal forests survived as forests because of mosquitoes. The heavy prevalence of malaria served to forestall major felling until the later half of the last century when the demand for construction timbers became great. Natural regeneration of sal has proved to be a difficult problem and is not yet solved after some forty years of endeavor.

Other sections of Champion's paper include comments on the grasslands of India, the western area and the Montane forests. He feels that even though man has progressed from being purely destructive to his present conservative policies of protection and controlled use, there is a continuing hazard to the forested areas resulting from the drastic changes being made in the name of desirable development.

In the discussion of the influence of climate on plantation crops in the southeast parts of the highlands of Ceylon, Manfred Domros reports an extensive study of the effect of rainfall and temperature on the distribution of important crops. The crops considered include tea, rubber, coconut, cocoa and coffee with investigations based on field work as well as on monthly, seasonal and annual rainfall and temperature data. His studies indicate the limiting influence of the dry period on the distribution of plantation crops. The general summary presents a rough idea of the difficult conditions for cultivation of plantation crops in areas where the natural conditions are not the best. The limiting effects of the dry period as well as the boundary of the temperature zones and their effects on the distribution of plantation crops provide strong evidence to show the inadequacy of annual rainfall data and the greater importance in favor of year-round available moisture data. Frequently the one or two or three months dry periods even in area of adequate annual rainfall mean the difference between successful and unsuccessful plantations.

Students of problems of developing areas will find much of interest in the discussion of agricultural colonization in the Kapatagan Basin of Mindanao, Philippines. Here, Klaus Hausherr has assembled statistics of land use, population data and maps of farm holdings to portray graphically the vexing problems of lack of land titles, widespread schistosomiasis, religious differences between Christians and Muslims and lack of financial credit as examples of factors that contribute to failure to achieve satisfactory agricultural production. Government encouragement of settlement of the area resulted in increasing the number of Christians from 24 in 1918 to approximately 8,000 by 1939. By 1960 it is estimated 100,000 people of whom 7,000 were Muslims had found new homes in the Kapatagan Basin. Although some roads have been built and governmental units have been established, the economy of the Basin remains at a low level.

The paper by Ulrich Schweinfurth on the rationale as well as the trials and tribulations of attempting the establishment of a new crop, pyrethrum, in the Central Cordillera of Eastern New Guinea is an interesting review of the many economic, geographic and social problems encountered. Considering that only as recent as 1933 the first "Outsider" appeared in the Upper Wahgi Valley, this paper serves to identify some of the problems of "assisting the people in the remote mountain areas of New Guinea to find their way into the future". One is tempted to hope that man's efforts to assist such people to find their way into the future will continue to be done with greatest sensitivity.

Studies of the shifting cultivation in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, East Pakistan, by S.L. Pardo and Lorenz G. Löffler describe with considerable detail cultivation activities carried out by hill tribesmen over the course of the year. The paper might be said to contain 18 statements in English by a headman of one of the tribes and a text in German to explain and expand upon the comments made.

The paper by Karl E. Weber entitled *Shifting Cultivation Among Thai Peasants—Some Working Hypotheses* could easily be the most provocative or controversial paper in the collection of Seminar reports. Dr. Weber, who was a member of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Expedition of 1964/65,

made his observations in Thailand in the year 1967/68. The author proposes several hypotheses or what he calls "statements of principle" resulting from his impressions. Some attention is given to attempts to clarify the differences between what he identifies as *integral* and *partial* system of shifting cultivation and the *complementary* as well as the *opportunistic*. The author makes the contention that at least a fourth of the agriculturally used land of the country is under shifting type cultivation as he defines the term. Although his definitions seem somewhat complex and of questionable applicability, his approach points out the great diversity in land use patterns in Thai agriculture especially in areas other than the central plains.

In another section he deals with what he ascribes the practice of ignoring the dualism in agriculture between wet and dry cultivation methods. One of the sections of his paper deals with the hypothesis "Shifting cultivation is causing waste of forestry wealth, degradation of vegetation, soil erosion, and unbalance of water household". It is observed that "the degradation of vegetation is no self destroying reaction consecutive to shifting cultivation". It usually starts when the population pressures in certain regions enforce a more intensified land use. While degradation of forest vegetation in Thailand from forest to bush vegetation has taken place, it is an open question as to when and over what period of time that might have happened. It is pointed out that according to Pendleton, "the more that soil is eroded the more the productivity under shifting cultivation would increase, and the earlier would it become feasible to change from the shifting to a permanent system of agriculture". The discussion also touches on the decrease in productivity and the lower average water supply following the installation and utilization of some of the large dams in the central plains of Thailand.

Other sections deals with the hypothesis "Any carrying capacity of shifting cultivation is unknown: yet it is assumed that it is not exhausted"; "Shifting cultivation could promote the development of agriculture; however, the probable contribution remains uncertain as long as neither its complex is known nor its importance is appreciated"; and "Shifting cultivation is regarded as a primitive land use pattern".



In general the author takes the view that shifting cultivation is regarded as a primitive land use pattern because it has remained rather unknown. He emphasises "the economic and social importance of shifting cultivation is being underestimated whereas its political importance is being overestimated". The author feels that instead of regarding the shifting cultivators as a traditionally inclined, almost nomadic and hence unreliable peasantry of the subsistence economy type, "shifting" farmers should be described as a population group composed of expert peasantry with rather different social attitudes and of relatively diversified economy types.

Friedhelm Scholz provides, among other observations, brief descriptions of activities and customs throughout a typical year and over an eight-year period population details for each of thirty families comprising the Akha Village Alum, Mae Chan District, Chiangrai Province in Northern Thailand. Details are presented showing ages, sex and "working force" of each family in 1968. Observations include the size of fields usually cleared and cultivated, the crops grown, and the agricultural practices during the year. The village did not practice a full subsistence economy and small amounts of chile and sesame are sold as well as rice to provide funds for certain items of clothing, petroleum, ornaments, flash lights, lipstick and face powder for young women and, in the instance of three families, transistor radios. While poppy cultivation had been abandoned in recent years, much-needed funds were used in some cases to purchase opium. Twenty-two members of the village, distributed in 16 households and consisting of 16 men and 6 women, were opium smokers.

As would be expected, the papers presented in the volume are varied in content, in extent of details presented and in the methods of approach. The three papers on shifting cultivators comprise important contributions to the knowledge of this incompletely-understood culture and agriculture. Students of Southeast Asia in specialized fields will find much of interest in a perusal of this collection of papers.

*James H. Jensen*

S.J. Tambiah *Buddhism and the Spirit Cults in Northeast Thailand*. (Cambridge Studies in Social Anthropology 2: C.U.P) 1970 pp. 388 £5.25

Dr. Tambiah's book is perhaps the first really solid anthropological study of any aspect of Thai society which has yet been produced, and as such is of major importance, not only to those students directly concerned with Thailand, but also to social anthropologists whose main interest lies elsewhere in Asia, or in other parts of the world.

Although the unit of study, the village of Baan Phraan Muan, is only 'one tiny spot in the backwoods of Thailand' the data obtained therefrom provides the basis for generalization to a much wider social arena. The main focus of the study is an analysis of the relationship between four ritual complexes which are enacted in the village, namely between 'rites performed by Buddhist monks and therefore labelled 'Buddhist' :*sukhwan* ritual, concerned with recalling the escaped essence of persons and performed by village elders; the cult of the guardian spirits or deities of the village, which has its own officiants . . . . . and rites addressed to malevolent spirits that cause individual illnesses, of which spirit possession is the most dramatic'. The author shows that Buddhist myth and ritual is dynamically related to the myths and rituals of the spirit cults, forming the organic and coherent pattern which is village religion. He demonstrates that there is no simple correspondence between myths and their associated rituals, but that taken together the complex of words and actions serves to portray the complexities and ambiguities in man's approach to central problems, and their solution.

Dr. Tambiah considers however that the religion of Baan Phraan Muan cannot properly be understood without reference to, and knowledge of, the great Buddhist literate tradition. He analyzes the connections—the continuities and transformations—by discussing, in juxtaposition, Buddhist cosmology as it is related in the Pali scriptures, and the village interpretation of such key concepts as merit and demerit on the one hand, and on the other by outlining the historical development of the *Sangha* (Buddhist Monkhood) prior to describing in detail the community in the village *wat* and its relations with local lay society. It is clear from the material presented that there exist, even within the village, individuals with different degrees of understanding and knowledge of the texts—as indeed there are many different levels and developments within the vast

corpus of literature—but for the average villager the efficacy of the Pali formulae used in ritual derives from the fact that they are believed to be the Words of the Buddha, and are intoned under certain prescribed conditions, by members of the *Sangha*, the religious elite; the translatability of the words is irrelevant, in view of their source.

Another major contribution made by this book is that the author shows how the system of religious categories is woven into the institutional context and social structure of Baan Phraan Muan. One aspect of this is the author's analysis of the relationship between monk and layman in terms of the reciprocity, ritual and otherwise, existing between them. The youths of the village, prior to marriage, temporarily assume the ascetic role of the monk, which in turn enables them to confer spiritual benefits on their seniors in the form of merit. In return the elders provide material support and certain of them act as lay ritual leaders, performing a particularly vital role in the life-affirming *khwan* rites as *paahm* or *mau khwan*, non-Buddhist specialists who normally acquire the necessary literacy in the *wat*, and tend to combine their new ritual role with lay leadership of the Buddhist congregation after disrobing.

One criticism of the author's presentation of this interesting material is that he has not used one of the many recognised systems of transliteration in dealing with the Thai terms (an omission which he disarmingly confesses in his preface), nor is he consistent in his own idiosyncratic usage. This may seem to some to be a relatively minor point, but such conventions should be observed, in the interests of anthropology's reputation as an academic discipline, if for no other reason.

This is by no means a book for the layman, nor for the student who expects his anthropological intake in an exotic form. As the author of the first scholarly work in the field of Thai anthropology Dr. Tambiah's task has been a very exacting one in that it not only involved his presenting a coherent analysis of specific problems but also his providing a great deal of primary data not available elsewhere. This study not only breaks new ground in Thai anthropology but also, in that it discusses such issues as the relationship between myth and ritual, between Great and Little Tradition and so on, sheds new light on old anthropological problems of more general concern.

*Jane Bunnag*

J.A. Niels Mulder *Monks, Merit and Motivation: An Exploratory Study of the Social Functions of Buddhism in Thailand in Processes of Guided Social Change* (Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, Illinois), 1969 pp. 43.

Schools, wells, roads and latrine-pits are, in the government's eyes, symbols of rural development: they must automatically promote 'social welfare' and contribute to 'national integration'. But the government finds difficulty in arousing local enthusiasm for co-operation on the projects. Professor Mulder's report, the first in a Special Report Series for publishing results of preliminary research, discusses the efficiency and wisdom of attempting to use the concept of merit or the members of the monkhood to canvas support.

In a total 14 months of research in the Bangkok/Thonburi area and unspecified villages in the Central Plain, Professor Mulder has attempted to examine the points of view of upper and lower ranks in the Sangha, the feelings of the villagers, and the position of Abbot, Headman and Headmaster as middlemen between government ambition and village action. Unfortunately, in a 'preliminary' paper of 34 pages (without the Appendices) the wide angle of observation has precluded any detailed focus.

One third of *Monks, Merit and Motivation* is devoted to merit: can merit, 'the central motivational and cognitive of element Theravada Buddhism', as it is understood at both 'national level' (by those at the top of the Sangha hierarchy) and village level be manipulated to 'bring about social and economic change in the Thai countryside'—or more specifically, to implement government building programmes?

At the top level, Professor Mulder found a division in opinions: younger monks saw their duties in traditional terms of living the holy life and striving towards Nirvana, while many salaried Sangha officials were ready to find 'nation-building' and modernization meritorious. Professor Mulder comments on the 'close integration of religious and political institutions' and 'the close supervision' of the Sangha by the secular government, but refrains from exploring further.

Even at the village level, Professor Mulder finds merit-making increasingly linked with gaining prestige and becoming 'more businesslike'—but this is not evident from the six examples he gives of people's attitude

to merit-making. Collective merit-making festivals he sees as "counterpoints" 'to an otherwise dreary and frugal existence'. (This townsman's assumption amuses me: I have found village life in Thailand to be far less dreary than village life in the blacked-out drabness of Western telly-land). Professor Mulder concludes that since 'there seems to be a general decline in the vitality of Thai Buddhism, and in this process the Wat seems to be changing from a religious and social focal point to an exclusively social centre of the communities', a manipulation of the concept of merit would not in itself provide strong enough motivation to villagers to divert their Wat building energies to road building. If people do co-operate to build feeder roads, it is because, he says, 'people have recognised their interest in better communication with the outside world'.

The middle part of *Monks, Merit and Motivation*, exploring the leadership potential of monks, focuses on relationships between the Sangha and the government at the national level and Sangha and Wat at village level. Monks have prestige—but is it the kind that can be used to support the politics of counter-insurgency?

As Mulder points out: '(the government) community development programme seems to have been instigated by more than an active concern for the welfare of the villagers, however. It appears that the main reasons for its implementation are political and are part of a larger scheme of counterinsurgency measures designed to fight unrest and political dissent....' At the national level, Mulder finds that the political involvement of the Sangha is 'revitalised and acquiring new dimensions' and 'is stimulated towards a new professionalism and has already accepted an active role in programs of national development'. At the village level, he notes that the Wat is the centre of communal life, and its Abbot is in a better position to influence villagers than the Headman or Headmaster. 'The abbot is the person who wields the greatest motivational power.'

Even so, Professor Mulder explains why monks would be inefficient agents for implementing the programmes (i.e. the 'processes of guided social change' of his paper's subtitle.) The government could undermine the prestige of the monks should they become overtly politically involved, and 'there exists a real danger that current efforts of the central government.... may very well weaken 'the whole institution of Buddhism in Thai Society.'

Professor Mulder concludes with 'recommendations'; but how he arrives at them or how they should be implemented is not quite clear. Government programmes 'will have to sincerely aim (sic) at improving the welfare of villagers as the primary goal' (but where is the politician who would admit otherwise?); secular programmes should be pushed through secular officials, therefore it would be desirable to bolster the position of the Headman (*Phuyaiban*). (But how? He suggests the Sangha could help the government, but earlier he commented on local tensions between Abbot and *Phuyaiban*); most difficult of all to effect, he recommends that 'A change in attitudes and behaviour on the part of the civil servants seem(s) to be necessary . . . . Respect should be shown to villagers and headmen alike.' (The respect system is one of the few really effective integrating factors in Thai national life: how should that be changed to order without provoking charges of 'communism'?)

There are hints of interesting fields for further enquiry in Professor Mulder's paper, and he gives a useful chart, in an appendix, of the relationships between the Sangha and the government heirarchies—but I wonder whether a Special Report Series, such as this one coordinated by M. Ladd Thomas, is a good idea for anthropology? It encourages publication of unfinished work—with results much like newspaper reports shorn of news-value and accurate details of names, times and places. Anthropologists and sociologists have the advantage over newspaper reporters in their background of comparative information and many years of training in analysis. A reporter is ruled by an immediate dead-line—but it takes time to use the tools of sociology. Asking an anthropologist to present a preliminary report, for publication, is like asking a sculptor to unveil his chosen piece of stone to the public before he begins cutting.

Given the time to finish his study, and the incentive of a dateline for publication of the completed work, Professor Mulder could no doubt have made the analyses he proposed in his Preface: 'to investigate the motivational qualities of Buddhism in rural Thailand' and to 'contribute to the understanding of Buddhism as a social force in Thai Society.' He says in the same Preface that there is a need for research on the place of Buddhism in Thai society. The fact that 'very little real progress has been made in the interpretation of Thai social dynamics,' he says, is not, in some cases because of a lack of data, 'but rather a lack of sociological analysis in depth.' A preliminary report cannot be an analysis "in depth".

*Diana Lancaster*

Shan-Chien-P'i-P'o-Sha—A Chinese version by Saṅghabhadra of *Samantapāsādikā*; translated into English by Prof. P.V. Bapat in collaboration with Prof. A. Hirakawa; (Bhandakar Oriental Series No. 10, published by Bhandakar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1970); pp. LXIII+588; Rs. 75, £4, \$10 US.

This work is a very useful addition to the literature on Vinaya, the code of laws, prohibitions and allowances for Buddhist monks. In English translation at present we have only the basic rules of the *Pāṭimokkha* (available from Mahāmakut Press in Bangkok), and the whole Vinaya Piṭaka under the title "The Book of the Discipline" (Pāli Text Society, London), but no Vinaya commentaries until the time of H.R.H. the late Sangharāja Vajirañāṇavarorasa's commentary written in the second decade of this century and which is now being published in English translation by Mahāmakut. This work (in translation "The Entrance to the Vinaya") is based on an earlier Thai composition the *Pubbasikkhāvaṇṇanā* and this in turn upon the Pāli commentary *Samanta-pāsādikā* and its sub-commentaries. So far, no one has tried his hand at translating the *Samantapāsādikā* into English\*, a formidable task as the text in roman script goes through seven books. For this reason, those who are not familiar with Pāli and yet would learn something of the commentarial tradition explaining Vinaya Piṭaka, have much to thank Professor Bapat for. Indeed his has been a great labour in producing this book and with his Japanese colleague he has added to our knowledge another work contained in the Chinese Tripiṭaka (Taisho. 1462).

The *Samantapāsādikā* which was edited to its present text by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa in the 5th century C. E., is the second layer of commentarial tradition on the Vinaya, the first being incorporated in the Vinaya Piṭaka itself as the old word-commentary of the Vibhanga together with its elaboration upon offences. The *Samantapāsādikā* goes further in its explanation of difficult points of Vinaya although it is not clear in all matters and suffers in some places from over-scholastic elaboration, and in others from lack of any explanation. It is still very valuable for understanding the Vinaya.

---

\* Except the Introduction: "The Inception of the Discipline", SBB vol. XXI, Pāli Text Society.

No doubt this was the reason for translating it into Chinese. The translator's name was Saṅghabhadra, a *bhikṣu* ordained in the Dharmagupta tradition. This fact explains the changes which he has made in translating from Pāli to Chinese, and perhaps, the new name given to the work in Chinese, corresponding to the Sanskrit: *Sudarśanavibhāṣā*. Very few other works were translated from Pāli into Chinese (the other notable one being the *Vimuttimaggā*, published in English translation from Ceylon as "The Path of Freedom"), and nothing else at all from the Pāli Vinaya. As this commentary was meant to help Chinese *bhikṣus* understand the Vinaya used in China, which was mostly from the Sarvāstivāda and Dharmagupta traditions, it had to be free of contradiction with the texts generally studied. So the translator has removed some of the minor differences between Theravāda and other traditions during his translation thus bringing it more in line with the Vinaya works already in Chinese. Another feature of his translation is the condensing or omission of several subjects, especially towards the end of his work. While the translator has also added some material, the net result is to shorten the *Samantapāsādikā* a great deal. The comments on the last chapters of the Vinaya, containing specialized treatises on various subjects, have in most cases been translated only in precis form, while some have been omitted. The commentary on the *Parivāra*, an early summary on Vinaya matters which has been included in the Vinaya Piṭaka in Theravāda tradition, is limited to one set of verses (Chapter 19). This suggests that the translation had to be hurried towards its end and so was shortened, or else, as Professor Bapat suggests, the Pāli text used by Saṅghabhadra may have been defective. The end of the work is abrupt as though broken off and has no concluding remarks by the translator, such as are usually found in the Chinese Tripiṭaka. Perhaps the end of Saṅghabhadra's translation, made in C. E. 489, was lost in the days before wood-block printing.

Now what variations do we find in this translation when compared to the Pāli *Samantapāsādikā*? A few names are missing from the list of Vinaya-teachers who took the Discipline to Ceylon. Also, the calendar which is given according to the Śaka system in the Pāli original is changed to the Chinese system—with some confusion. The enumeration of some technical terms is different, following the Sanskrit traditions with



twelve austere practices (instead of thirteen as in Pāli), and so on. In numbers the Chinese translation is moderate, while the Samantapāsādikā inclines to exaggeration. In Chinese, the Thera Mahinda with one thousand *bhikkhus* sat down at Thūpārāma in Ceylon, but the original in Pāli says that there were sixty thousand. Various words are explained according to the Sanskrit tradition as opposed to the Pāli, while various pairs of *bhikkhus* frequently named together in Pāli and comprising the infamous Group of Six, are taken as one person. Again, some of the variations in the Chinese translation are simply due to the translator's misunderstanding of the Pāli original, as when he renders *nava* by 'nine' when it should mean in its context 'new'; *satta* is also mistranslated as 'being' (Skt. *sattva* when it means in context, 'seven'). There are numbers of such misunderstandings.

The fact that Saṅghabhadra followed the Dharmagupta tradition has also led to changes in the Chinese version, the principal one being the insertion of 24 Sekhiyas or rules of training, though the translator remarks that they did not exist in the original Indian text as the *stūpas* and images of Buddha referred to were not in existence in the Buddha-time. The translator also adheres to the Sanskrit tradition, using for the second most serious class of offence, *Saṅghāvaśesa* though he has tried to explain this according to the Pāli *Saṅghādisesa* = the Sangha (meeting) at the beginning and at the end.

Professor Bapat writes (p. XI in his lengthy and comprehensive introduction): "The life of Bhikkhus, at the time of the composition of the original Vinaya, was a life of plain simplicity without any expectation of luxuries as is proved by the Four Reliances (nissayarag-robcs, almsfood, tree-root dwelling and fermented urine) . . . . "The life that is projected in commentaries like Samantapāsādikā has not remained so simple. We have a picture here of Buddhist Bhikkhus living in rich monasteries endowed with parks, fields, tanks, fisheries and temples with the images of the Buddha." Now this is a little confusing. Lord Buddha taught the Dhamma-Vinaya for forty-five years and while there is no doubt at all at the beginning of that period that the life of *bhikkhus* was very austere with only the four reliances (or supports), it is clear from the Vinaya itself that very soon numbers of rich people became his

ardent supporters, and the equally devoted supporters of the Arahant Theras. This meant that parks were given, and these quickly turned into monasteries even during the Buddha's time. With monasteries established and the rapid spread of the Dhamma throughout all levels of Indian society, there were soon allowances made for the possession by *bhikkhus* and the *sangha* of many other things. Even so, there were *bhikkhus* then, just as there are now, who preferred to live by the ancient ascetic standards.

So it is not that the Vinaya portrayed the "plain simplicity" while the Atthakathās or commentaries show "rich monasteries". Rather there was a continuous development, checked by the prohibitions issued by Lord Buddha and perhaps by those extra minor prohibitions occurring in the commentaries, but allowed when in accord with what was suitable as laid down in the Vinaya.

Still, there is no doubt that in India, (and in other countries), this drift towards "rich monasteries" became a cause for the downfall of the Buddhasāsana. Riches attract the greedy while the patched robes and iron bowl of a wandering *bhikkhu* attract no robbers, as Lord Buddha pointed out in the Jātaka. Some of the accounts of the well-endowed Buddhist monasteries of India and Ceylon, as reported by the various Chinese pilgrim *bhiksus*, are certainly far from Lord Buddha's intentions.

This master-work of Professors Bapat and Hirakawa has been printed out of a grant generously given by a Japanese Buddhist organization, the Reiyukai Kyodan. It has been well printed considering the difficulties of incorporating many Chinese types into the translation and its notes. And though a good effort has been made to correct errors in printing, there are still large numbers which are not mentioned in the Corrections and Additions (p. 586f). This work is rounded off with an Index of Chinese Words, followed by a general Consolidated Index. The binding is strong and serviceable as befits a book which will be much used by all those interested in the Vinaya.

*Phra Khantipālo*

John Blofeld *The Way of Power—A Practical Guide to the Tantric Mysticism of Tibet* (George Allen and Unwin Ltd., London) 1970 pp. 255. £ 2.25.

In *The Way of Power* the author sets out to describe and explain in a non-technical way the character of Tibetan Buddhist practice. It is an introductory work intended for the reader whose only qualification is an interest in the subject. It is not, however, a book for the lazy.

Part I is on Background and Theory. After an initial chapter on the meaning of mysticism, its occurrence in the Vajrayana of Tibet, and its possible application in the modern Western world, there follows a first class chapter on the principles of Buddhism in the Mahayana setting. Then there are two chapters on the essence and symbolism of the Tantric method. (In passing it should be noted that the Buddha-figures depicted in Diagram 3B do not correspond to the arrangements in Diagrams 3A, 3C, and 3D)

Part II is on Practice. It is filled with much detail and contains such topics as the initiation, the grand prostrations, the generation of Bodhicitta, the Yidam (a symbolic deity required for meditation), special rites, and so on. The climax of the book is a chapter on the Sadhanas, and one of them is outlined in detail. It consists of a highly complex system of recitations, visualizations, and other manipulations of the mind. According to the author such meditations are potentially dangerous for anyone who attempts them without a skilled teacher. Therefore, in conformity with the usual practice in Tibet, his teacher charged him not to reveal the details. The result is that in this chapter we have merely a descriptive account without any explanation. The author's main purpose is to remove certain false beliefs about the sadhanas that have been published by other writers.

A final chapter gives brief accounts of special advanced practices such as the six yogas (psychic heat, and so on), and prajnaparamita. Readers who want more details of these topics are referred to the standard works.

As usual in John Blofeld's writing the style is imaginative and readable. The quality of the work is assured by the author's obvious sincerity of purpose and his first-hand experience of the meditations. Although this book is written so as to be accessible to the non-specialist, the serious scholar will find here a unique account of the principles of the Vajrayana techniques. Tibetan Buddhism is Buddhism in its most elaborate form (the opposite pole to Zen). The author shows clearly how the underlying essence of the Vajrayana is the same as that of other forms of Buddhism.

*Robert Exell*

ed. Sulak Sivaraksa *VISAKHA PUJA 2513* (The Buddhist Association of Thailand, Bangkok) 1970. pp. 110.

*VISAKHA PUJA*, the annual publication of the Buddhist Association of Thailand, continues to keep its high standard under the same editor who has been producing the informative English manual on Thai Buddhism for over seven years. The present issue opens with a Pali verse expounding the significance of Magha Puja, an important Buddhist ceremony, revived in Siam by the learned King Mongkut. It is followed by the translations of discourses and stanzas on the Dhamma in Pali, Sanskrit and Tibetan. A discourse entitled "The bhikshu's predilection" is of special interest, a timely reminder of the true meaning of monkhood in this age of rapid change. Readers will learn much about the religious scholarship of King Rama IV from his Pali verses in the article combined with a biographical note written by the late Supreme Patriarch Pavaresvariya-longkorn. An anonymous short paper on Prince Vajirañāṇavarorasa offers a good clue to those who wish to know about the great reorganizer of the Thai Sangha in modern period.

*VISAKHA PUJA 2513* contains several articles on the Dhamma, both objective and subjective. Included in the former category is Dr. Jane Bunnag's interesting article on the relationship between monks and laymen in a Buddhist society of the central Thailand. Donald K. Swearer sympathetically observes three possibilities for change in Thai Buddhism, viz, the Buddhist Universities with their reformed curricula, the monks' participation in the community development programs and Buddhadasa Bhikkhu's reformist movement in his forest hermitage in southern Thailand. Phra Maha Chai Apakaro convincingly points out the existing discrepancy between tradition-bound Pali scholars and young student monks in the present-day ecclesiastical educational system. Phra Maha Sathien Thiranana's report on the seminar on "Buddhism and Thai Society" held at the Siam Society in 1969 relevantly summarizes the discussion at that important gathering. In this connection, the readers with a knowledge of Thai are recommended to follow the details of the meeting in the report of the proceedings published by the Society under the title of พุทธศาสนา กับ สังคมไทยปัจจุบัน. Among the diversified views on the Dhamma expressed by both Thai and foreign adherents of Buddha's teachings, mention must be made of Ven. Buddhadasa's speech, "Exchanging Dhamma while fighting." His Dhamma=God=Nature doctrine may embarrass some orthodox Theravadins in the country for its uniqueness. It is significant to note, however, that the modern forest dweller is undoubtedly the most popular and prolific expounder of the Buddhist faith in Thailand.

The book is lavishly illustrated with well-selected photographs which give to the readers the real feeling of living Buddhism.

*Yoneo Ishii*

### Recent Siamese Publications

438. Phuttarājaraksā, Luan : *Suwannahongs* สุวรรณหงส์ an old reader in use in monasteries for boys and apprentices; edited and published by the Ven. Āra Īsāl-dhammaraṇsi of Pāṭaluṇ, 2512 pp. 454

This old southern Thai romance is said to have been written for young people of some 'five generations ago' by a certain Luan Puttharājaraksā, a citizen of *tambol* Lampam in the province of Pāṭaluṇ. The reckoning may not have been very accurate though it may be calculated to have come down roughly some two centuries. Unfortunately the copying and printing has undergone some modernisation and is no longer possible to verify the date by orthographic means. The venerable author is generally referred to by present generations as *Āmput* in common parlance and is said to be unexcelled by other writers in the south in those days.

The saga about the hero Suwannahongs, i.e. the 'Golden Swan' doing a remarkable tight-rope walk of some 150 leagues to reach the closely guarded quarters of the King's palace where the heroine, Kes Suriyongs, lives. This is a well known Thai folklore, but the story has been retold by Āmput, our antique poet, to read as though instead of doing the marvellous walk on a kite string our hero employed his supernatural powers to reach the palace by air. The modification, though suggestive of a mode of travel which was then quite unknown, is interesting in that it is presuggestive, if we may term it, of air travel, and our writers of the south make much of it. The 'plane' in fact is represented as a 'golden haṇsa'. It is characteristic of our southern neighbour's humour and as such it is to be commended. The saga is not anything more than a fantastic piece of imaginative humour but as such it has been cleverly and willingly told though it would be nearly impossible for any modern literary critic to go through the whole work.

439. The Ven. Āra Dharmakośācāryā; *Vessantara Jātaka* ปิณฑนวรรคชาดก ๑๓๓๓ A critical study (Soemwit Library, Bangkok,) 2512 pp. 532.

We do not pretend to know what ปิณฑน (paritas) means. Etymologically it corresponds to the Sanskrit *Paridarśana*, which, we *presume*, has been adopted in Thai as an equivalent for a critical study. The Jātaka

itself is widely popular in this country and in other Buddhist lands of Southeast Asia. It is the last and best known work of the Ceylonese *tipitaka* adopted here from time immemorial. The occasion of its recitation is fixed at harvest time when the serious work in the monastery regarding monastic education comes to an end for the season and the people are ready to enjoy a festival as a holiday.

The Siamese version, of which several exist, is now prescribed as a literary text in schools; it is, in fact, one of the two literary pieces that have come in from India from remote times and have become so acclimatised that the average countryfolk would feel hurt to be told that it is an Indian immigrant rather than the real Thai product. To be correct of course what we see of it is Thai, for, though the Pali verses are acknowledged as the original texts, that language has become so familiar to us that it has acclimatised itself. The Thai oldest version on this topic is said to date from the days of Ayudhyā. There have come into existence besides other Thai versions, some bearing the title of 'royal versions' from the fact that they were written under royal patronage at different periods. All this is in explanation of the status of classic and has no connection with the poem under review.

The venerable writer of the critical review which is the topic of our study observes very correctly that the primary aim of the work was to illustrate the virtue of charity as pictured in the person of the chief character of Vessantara. He acknowledges that many criticise this as being overdone; whilst others hold up the character as an unsurpassed ideal of charity and self-sacrifice.

The poem is divided into 13 cantos. The method of criticism adopted by the venerable gentleman is to take them singly; his valuation of the old poem is worthy of a scholar though now and then his very modern application causes some hesitations on the reader's part. In the first canto, the 'TEN BOONS' requested by the celestial maiden prior to ending her life in heaven are, as the writer says, natural request for a woman. His discussion of the boons is full and the average reader may be inclined to feel that they are hardly necessary. His comparison between the forester guarding the domains of Āceta and the *rishi* Aṣṭa living almost on the borders of the Wōṅkot mountain, whom the venerable gentleman

seems inclined to suspect of having been stationed to guard the safety of the royal exiles from Sibi, is ingenious. His evaluation of the three characters, the forester, the *rishi* Ačuta and the beggar Jujok, is certainly clever and readable. His geography of the classical lands where all this takes place may not be up to date but it is excusable. Sibi, for instance, is 'in the northern country at the foot the Himalāya' according to his version which has been taken from the Ceylonese tradition; though the locality of that name does exist in Pakistan, no historian cares to try and identify it in view of its great age, the absence of relics and other means wherewith to locate its historical status.

In short this critical study is a pioneer work in Siamese and as such should be given an honoured place in the history of romantic writing in our literature.

440. *Records of the ceremony of Water Consecration of an Heir to the Throne* จดหมายเหตุพระราชพิธีลงสรงสมเด็จพระเจ้าฟ้ามหาจักรพรรดิ สยามมกุฎราชกุมาร compiled from contemporary sources by His late Royal Highness Prince Bhānurāṇsi (Pračaksh Press, Bangkok,) 2513, ill. pp. 444.

The publication is a fitting memorial to the late Police General Pra Āinič Jonkadi who made his name in the police service and also in the banking business. The origin of the ceremony of immersion of the King's heir as a measure of consecration was probably a confirmation of the young prince's legal right to the Throne, no longer necessary now owing to the Palatine Law which has been acknowledged by the Constitution. It has been remarked that in the almost 200 years of the present régime of the Čakri dynasty in Bangkok, two such ceremonies have been celebrated, though the rite had been known before these two occasions having been fairly fully described in the Rāmakien of 1897 from the pen of King Rāma the Great.

The ceremony as practiced in the reign of King Chulālonkorn is reproduced from firsthand sources. It consisted of three days of benedictory services and a final rite of immersion in the waters of the Čaoprayā river in front of the landing of the Grand Palace in full ceremony, followed by further benedictions in Brahmin rites in the form of passing the Holy Agni around the young prince and presentation of riches by the royal parents and relatives and the Court. A noticeable feature of the benediction was the participation by representatives of the provinces or their deputies.

441. Phalajivin, S: *The Rāmāyana of Brahmarishi Vālmīki* รามายณ ของวราลัมภิ a metrical translation into Siamese (Pračandra Press, Bangkok) 2514 pp. 275.

The translator presented the work to His Majesty as a birthday present last December. His Majesty then decided to have this classic published on account of its being the pioneer work by a Siamese to make known to the public a Sanskrit classic of world renown. An opportunity occurred when in view of the imminent cremation of the remains of the late Mom Dvivong, His Majesty's Grand Chamberlain ranking practically with a Minister of State, a fitting tribute was being sought to commemorate the occasion. Hence the publication under review.

The saga of Rāma is well known all over Southeast Asia. The classic *Rāmāyana* of Vālmīki is however not the Siamese *Rāmakien*. The *Rāmakien* is comparatively late, though it was inspired by a Rāma saga known long before which might have emigrated perhaps orally at first from south India to the Empire of Srivijaya, whence it came into this country long before the *Rāmakien* was written by King Rāma the Great of Thailand.

The narrative in a majestic *klōṅ* (โคลงฉันท์) metre, reminiscent of the *Yuanpāi* of Ayudhyā days, has been well written, as the classic deserves, though in places it is not strictly in keeping with the metrical terseness of the *Yuanpāi*. The epilogue acknowledges making use of the English précis of Drs V.S. Sāstri and P.P.S. as well as the *Sources of the Rāmakien* from the pen of His late Majesty King Rāma VI, to whose memory the translator modestly apologises in the regular Thai fashion.

The story follows the well-known theme of the classical *Rāmāyana* with the beginning and ending that transformed the narrative into sacred lore.

442. *The Coronation ... of King Bhumibol with a summary of the account of King Prajadhipok's Coronation* พระราชพิธีบรมราชาภิเษกสมรส, บรมราชาภิเษกและเฉลิมพระราชสมภพเจ้าเพชร

The ceremonies of the Marriage, the Coronation and the Formal Assumption of the Royal Residence by His Majesty King Bhumibol in 2493 compiled from official sources and a summarised account of the Coronation ceremony of King Prajadhipok by Kromamun Bidyalabh, (Excise Department Press, Bangkok) 2514, ill. pp. 280.



As a tribute to their late chief, Mom Dvivoṅś, the Crown Property Bureau under the leadership of Mr. Punpoem Krairiksh, the new superintendant who has succeeded Mom Dvivoṅś, the publication under review is offered to the public. It consists of material which had been written with great ability by the former Master of Ceremonies, Prayā Devādhirāj, who had, in accord with the wish of the government of Pibul Songrām, demoted himself from the style and title bestowed upon him by the Sovereign. The material thus contributed is very valuable for the author was one who knew about ceremonies better than anyone else. An error of arrangement is the introduction by this reviewer, for his own writing about the Coronation of King Prajādhīpok was intended as a preface for his material and is printed at the end of the book (pp. 265-280).

The portion dealing with the Marriage, Coronation and Assumption of the Royal Residence, which is well illustrated with reproductions in colour of the regalia and other scenes, taken from official papers, was in all probability written as official information by the above-named Master of Ceremonies himself. These details of the ceremonies were, prior to the events to take place, submitted to the Privy Council who passed them with very little correction.

An interesting annexe, which did not occur in the original papers, is the account of localities in all sections of the Kingdom whence the consecrated water was brought (pp. 186-264),

The section about the coronation of King Prajādhīpok was a summary of the material written by the then President of the Siam Society in the capacity of the King's Private Secretary at the King's suggestion for the information of foreigners attending the long ceremonies.

Though these accounts have been widely circulated among the public both in Thai and English, it is perhaps the only publication wherein all this information has been gathered together in one volume.

443. *An account of Funerary Urns* คำานานพระโกศและหีบศพและธรรมเนียมปฏิบัติ (Pračand Press, Bangkok) 2514 ill. pp. 77.

This is an account of the cases (*Kōs & Hīb*) bestowed upon the dead in recognition of their rank or service to the state. Some time ago such a treatise was written by Their Royal Highnesses Princes Sommot, Damrong

and Nariś; but a long time has elapsed and many changes in royal protocol have taken place since then. Officials of the Office of the Royal Household have supplemented it with the regulations for honouring the dead.

The publication is sponsored by officials of the Royal Household in honour of the late Grand Chamberlain.

All three of the above publications have been memento gifts in connection with the cremation of Mon Dvivoṅṣ.

444. *Customs in the Royal Court* พระเพณีในราชสำนัก by various authors including the deceased himself (Pračandra Press, Bangkok) 2514, 444 ill. pp. 191.

This publication, sponsored by the family of the dead, consists of material of a wide range of interest and is beautifully illustrated with rare photographs, some of which are not to be had elsewhere. Starting with the usual appreciations from relatives and friends occupying some 104 pages, we come on to a lecture by the deceased on Customs in the Royal Court delivered to an audience of Thai diplomatic officials; then the draft of a lecture never delivered anywhere on the Ceremony of Taking the Water of Allegiance viewed from an historical aspect and described with every detail with an interesting informatory note on the royal weapons, some of which, such as the Sword of Victory, are included in the formal state regalia. There is a translation into Siamese of the article contributed to *Artibus Asiae* on the old screen of gilt lacquer which used to partition the southern wing of the Dusit Hall; a description of the images of the Buddha installed on the altar around the Emerald Buddha in the Chapel Royal; a memorandum on the official status of members of the Royal Family and another on the recent coronation of His present Majesty—the three last being from the pen of Mom Rājawoṅṣ Sēṅsūrya Ladāvalya of the Bureau of the Royal Household.

445. Čandraprabhā, S: Her Majesty Queen Srisavarindirā สมเด็จพระศรีสวรินทิรา a biography (Bamruṅ-nukulkič Press, Bangkok) 2514, pp. 408.

By way of commemorating the occasion of the unveiling of Her Majesty's effigy, coinciding with the opening of three additional wards in the Somdeč Sanatorium at Śrīrājā, two volumes were issued. One is an

up-to-date description of the Sanatorium, started in the years when Her Majesty Queen Sawāṇ-wadhanā, as she then was, took up residence there for her health. She had just lost her eldest son, Prince Mahā Vajirunhiś, the Heir to the Throne, from which she suffered greatly and had to retire to the seclusion of a country house as the first building was. Since then the sanatorium has been continually extended till it is now better known as the Somdech Hospital of Śrīrājā and a very important centre of recuperation under care of the Thai Red Cross. The publication is a complete guide to the institution. As such however it is hardly a book for review in these pages.

The other publication, however, is a valuable historical document, since it is the biography of an important personage in the land. It is written in good, clear Siamese such as cannot be easily found in the world of books. The biography is told in excellently simple language. The material has been collected from first-hand sources, including, for example, the information supplied by Princess Abhasrābhā Devakul who in the last years of Her Majesty's life was the Queen's constant attendant and companion.

It is said in the biography that a feature of the Queen's life was a succession of occasions for grief which Her Majesty bravely bore. The death of her eldest son, the Heir to the Throne, wrecked her happiness; deaths of younger children were also instrumental in shaping her sad life, perhaps forming her disposition to bear with her sufferings; the impeachment and what people thought to be a most unfair sentence passed upon her adopted son, Prince Raṅsit of Jainād, almost took the life out of the octogenarian lady only to be supplemented by the saddest of her tragedies—the death of her beloved grandson King Ananda at a time when he seemed to be full of promise for the Nation's future.

There is just one comment to be made about an otherwise perfect piece of writing. The 408 pages of this biography, though told with spirit and accuracy, form a long piece of narration which lacks any kind of division like chapters or parts. It needs intense attention to read through and digest the whole work. The reviewer knew Her Majesty personally all his life and still remembers being most kindly treated by her, and it was therefore no heavy task to get through this long book at

a single reading. What about other people who have neither a similar interest in nor the same respectful love for the kindly personage?

The historian can find a great deal to learn from the book.

446. Česdābodindra, H.R.H. Kromamun: A Panegyric of King Rama II published in commemoration of the duocent enary of the latter, in klōṇ verse, ไคลงขอพระเกียรติพระบาทสมเด็จพระพุทธเลิศหล้านภาลัย พระราชนิพนธ์พระบาทสมเด็จพระนั่งเกล้า 4th edition (Sivaporn Press, Bangkok) 2511, pp. 72.

A review of this booklet from the pen of the Prince who became known later as Pra Nangklaṇ or Rama III should have been included in the series of reviews for the occasion in JSS LVII, 1. but was missed by an oversight. It has never been noticed before and it is appropriate that the omission should be rectified.

This panegyric has been considered a classic for the historian and student of state customs because of its compact and accurate description. The royal author moreover was himself the superintendant of the coronation ceremonies. It was first published as long ago as 1896; and has since appeared again in 1925 and 1929. Momluang Pin Mālākul, who was the editor of the edition under review, says that the original text, written on the old *khoy* manuscript, was in a bad condition and the printed copies made things worse by correcting the original spelling, thus rendering it more difficult to check some of the dubious points. The work has been given different names. The poem is all of one piece, without divisions, and deals chiefly with the coronation of Rama II. There is a reference to the Portuguese diplomatic mission which has received a long note in this booklet. Mention is made of another diplomatic mission from "Krabilaṇpasdu" to admire the King's white elephant but this has not drawn any comment from the editor.

*Dhani*

### Books Received for Subsequent Review

- J.M. Cadet: *The Ramakien—the Thai epic* (Kodansha, 1970) pp. 256 ill. \$14.50
- Cynthia H. Enloe: *Multi-Ethnic Politics: the case of Malaysia* (Center for South and SEAsian Studies, University of California, Berkeley: Research Monograph no. 2) 1970 pp. 172
- Tom Harrisson & Stanley J. O'Connor: *Gold and Megalithic Activity in Prehistoric and Recent West Borneo* (Data paper no. 77 Southeast Asia Program, Department of Asian Studies, Cornell University, Ithaca) 1970 pp. 331, \$4.00
- C.F.W. Higham & R.H. Parker: *Prehistoric investigations in N.E. Thailand 1969-70: preliminary report* (University of Otago, Dunedin) 1970 pp. 57
- B.F. Leach: *The Concept of Similarity in Prehistoric Studies* (Studies in Prehistoric Anthropology vol. 1; Anthropology Department, University of Otago, Dunedin) 1969 pp. 148
- M.L. Manich Jumsai: *King Mongkut and Sir John Bowring* (Chalermnit, Bangkok) 1970 pp. 240 \$7.50
- J.J. Nevadomsky & Alice Li: *The Chinese in Southeast Asia: a selected and annotated bibliography of publications in Western languages 1960-70* (Center for South and SEAsian Studies, University of California, Berkeley: Occasional Paper no. 6) 1970 119 pp.
- Nha-Trang Cong-Huyen-Ton-Nu: *Vietnamese Folklore: an introductory and annotated bibliography* (Center for South and SEAsian Studies, University of California, Berkeley: Occasional Paper no. 7) 1970 pp. 33